NATIONAL MUNICIPAL REVIEW

VOL. XII, No. 5 MAY, 1923 TOTAL No. 83

COMMENT

We wish to correct our statement in the April REVIEW that the statewide, optional city-county consolidation measure passed in Montana was a substitute for the Butte-Silver Bow measure drafted by A. R. Hatton. Later advices make it clear that both measures passed, the former being modeled on the latter and extending the privilege of city-county consolidation under the manager form to all the counties of the state.

*

We announce with regret the death of George E. Kessler of St. Louis, who passed away in Indianapolis on the nineteenth of March. His activities for civic betterment are well known and appreciated and he will be sorely missed from the ranks of those who are struggling to make our cities healthier and pleasanter places in which to live.

*

Two women have joined the ranks of the city managers. Mrs. Bertha Heidenfelder became the first woman manager when she accepted the managership of Collinsville, Oklahoma, and Mrs. R. E. Barrett has the honor of being the second. She is manager of Warrenton, Oregon. For further details see City Manager Department.

*

The voters of the second district of Wilkinsburg, it has developed, recently elected to the office of assessor a man who never existed. In some unexplained manner the name of J. J. Weldin appeared on the ballot. He was elected, but after a search lasting a month it was disclosed that no such man ever lived there. The court declared the office vacant and made a new appointment.

*

Doremus Elected Mayor of Detroit—Consolidated Court Given Jolt

Frank E. Doremus was elected mayor of Detroit at the election in April by a majority of 54,000. He has long been a prominent Democrat but is now pledged to maintain Detroit's tradition of absolute nonpartisanship. At the same election the people adopted a charter amendment providing pensions to city employees and voted $5,000,000 additional bonds for street railway extensions and improvements, and $12,000,000 bonds for establishing a municipal light and power plant. The present municipal light plant is not adequate and more power is needed for the municipal street railway.

Mayor Doremus, who was backed by union labor in the election, is already confronted with a demand from the car men on the municipal street railway for a 20 per cent increase in wages and for recognition of the street car men's union.

A big fight centered around the municipal court. The four judges who have been leading the program for the new unified court were up for re-election. Of these Judges Keidan and Cotter were re-elected, but Judges Marsh and Heston were defeated. The places of the latter will be filled by two new men pledged to sustain the new court but supported solidly by its enemies. A hopeful feature is the pledge of all seven judges elected to sustain the new court and to develop the psychopathic and probation features and to oppose political influence. The disappointing feature, however, is that the majority control of the court passes out of the hands of those who made it and are responsible for its success.

*

Royal Commission Reports Against Consolidation of Metropolitan London

The Royal Commission on London Government has reported against any changes in the present multiple system of local government in London which would centralize the numerous local governments under a single authority. The commission has been sitting since December, 1921, and its findings will be of great interest to Americans who live in large urban areas governed by two or more overlapping local governments.

The London County Council, which now exercises authority over Metropolitan London in a few matters, notably education and public health, sponsored the plan for consolidation, but the numerous metropolitan boroughs opposed it successfully. Local pride is strong in London as with us (as many who live in Boston, Cleveland and other cities can testify) and the London boroughs are joyful in the thought that the "imperialistic" designs of the County Council have been frustrated. However, we predict that the matter is no more settled in London than is our cities which, like Chicago, suffer under the wastes and duplications of a multiplicity of local governments.

Metropolitan London is blessed (or cursed) with an extremely complex government. There is nothing in the United States like it, although our condition is often bad enough. There is first of all the City of London, that ancient corporation governing the territory contained, for the most part, within the old city wall. Then there is the administrative county of London governed by the County Council, from which, however, the City is excluded. But the administrative county is composed of 28 metropolitan boroughs, each maintaining a separate government with its own mayor and council. There are also 28 boards of guardians, 26 assessment committees, four boards of managers of school districts, one sick asylum board and one metropolitan asylums board. In addition there are various boards, such as the Metropolitan Water Board and the Port of London Authority, with jurisdiction over areas extending beyond the administrative county.

To the average American this presents a *prima facie* case for consolidation. Not so to the Londoner. Nevertheless there is sentiment in favor of consolidation and simplification. The London *Municipal Journal* is a particularly staunch advocate of the latter. In the long run such opinion will prevail.

DETROIT PLEASED WITH NON-PARTISAN BALLOT

A REJOINDER TO "PARTIES IN NON-PARTISAN BOSTON"

BY W. P. LOVETT

Secretary, Detroit Citizens League

"PARTIES in Non-Partisan Boston," an interesting article in the NATIONAL MUNICIPAL REVIEW for February, while making a real contribution to discussion of the question, is certainly open to objection on the ground that the author, David Stoffer of Harvard Law School, has drawn unscientific conclusions from insufficient data. From the standpoint of Detroit, the fourth city of America in population, which has had non-partisan government more than four years, a general invitation is extended to all-comers to investigate, report, and testify as to the facts.

Briefly stated, Mr. Stoffer's argument is that under its non-partisan plan of government, Boston still has local parties, definitely aligned, hence the assumed promise of "abolition of parties" in local government has not been redeemed; that non-partisan elections "have contributed towards a higher type of official and an improved administration" but "these benefits have been purchased at a heavy cost": retention of a partisan line-up, and "an intensification of the racial and religious question"; and that data supporting this conclusion, chiefly procured in Boston, have been re-enforced by "a survey by correspondence of thirty other non-partisan cities."

"A survey by correspondence" is helpful, to some extent, but it is open to considerable doubt as a basis for the conclusion given above. Correspondence has come to Detroit concerning this problem, and our experience in trying to analyze our own situation and make reply leads me to hesitate in adopting Mr. Stoffer's broad deductions. Both correspondence and personal contacts in many non-partisan cities, big and little, further force me to raise questions as to the actual facts, and as to conclusions which may be warranted at this time.

WHAT ARE NON-PARTISAN ELECTIONS INTENDED TO SECURE?

Most controversies, especially in the fields of religion and politics, suffer from the handicap of poor definitions. Granting that Boston experience alone might justify most of Mr. Stoffer's arguments, I admit it is news to me that the non-partisan objective has been entire abolition of parties. Was the movement not launched chiefly as a means of ridding local government of the burdens always carried when national parties, widely organized, insisted on dictating in the purely local field? Is not this view vastly different from one which would assume the desirability of abolishing all local organized groups, platforms, programs and candidates, and forever keeping them in a state of abolition? I believe there has been a general, wholesome tendency to develop new local groups, based on legitimate local issues, di-

vorced in most cases from the national party organizations. And I question whether the peril of religious and racial issues, in the local field, has yet become sufficiently serious to warrant anything like the broad, final conclusions stated by Mr. Stoffer.

Mr. Stoffer says: "A municipal party may fairly be defined as any political organization which, independently of the state and national parties, habitually participates in local elections in support of certain candidates, principles, or policies." The analogy here to local voters' leagues, etc., is, in my judgment, weak. First, the old type of party is based on nominations dictated by the bosses. The average voters' league, at least, is administered by large numbers of citizens, who directly or indirectly express their opinions about candidates after the contestants are in the race, and not, as a rule, beforehand. Secondly, the party, as such, lives on "jobs," political patronage, and selfish preferment in office; where is the evidence showing that citizens' organizations, working for clean, non-partisan elections, exert themselves to control appointments, in any large number of instances? Thirdly, the factor of permanence, over periods of time, with political parties is something lamentably lacking, thus far, in the field of municipal reform. In fact, we are still admitting that "the salvation of the city," more often than not, is postponed because good citizens, standing for the non-partisan idea, are afflicted with "spasms of virtue" but do not endure.

Still another, though more general, item in the analysis consists in the fact that parties are usually selfish in method, motive and objective, while local reform groups, sustained solely by volunteer contributions from individuals, in the great majority of cases have no axes to be ground, no enemies to punish, no friends to reward; they work patiently for the public good, and are likely to receive more kicks than thanks for their pains. It is due largely to these local non-partisan groups in American cities that James Bryce's indictment of many years ago was decidedly altered when his last opinion was published in *Modern Democracies.*

RELIGIOUS AND RACIAL LINES

With reference to Detroit, while it is true that attempts have been made to draw religious and racial lines in local political campaigns, those attempts thus far have had little or no appreciable effect on the elections themselves; what may occur in future is still to develop. The perils pictured by Mr. Stoffer absolutely do not apply here. On the other hand we have had groups, controversies and alignments, purely local and legitimate, concerning municipal ownership of street cars, preservation or disruption of our clean election system, enforcement of law, honesty as against graft in city government, preservation of real non-partisanship in elections, economy or extravagance in administration of public schools, and maintenance of an efficient municipal court.

These and other issues, without doubt, will in future operate toward local party groupings, from time to time. Personalities of course enter into the contests. We are thankful and humble when we think of what the people, as a family of a million, have done for themselves on wholly community lines. But we have no idea of going back to the ward or party system. We get co-operation publicly among Roman Catholics, Protestants, Jews, and other sorts of religious people. We ask and expect men as

candidates to stand forth as men, citizens of Detroit, whose platform is "a business-like administration of community affairs, without waste, graft, or favoritism." And thus far we have not even dreamed of witnessing within our gates any "shrouded form with masked face" to terrify voters whose chief boast is that they are free Americans.

THE BREAKDOWN OF CITY GOVERNMENT DUE TO GREATER COST AND NEW FUNCTIONS

BY LAWSON PURDY

Summary of an address delivered before the banquet session of our Philadelphia meeting, November, 1922. :: :: :: :: ::

THREE days ago Mr. Dodds asked me to come here and speak on city government.[1] I yielded because I owe the League too much to refuse to render any service within my power. I told Mr. Dodds that I had in mind the growing complexity and cost of city government and its failure to meet the new demands upon it. That very afternoon my evening paper carried the news that in a city of the middle west the schools were closed for lack of money. My morning paper the next day carried the news that the firemen had been dismissed in another city in the middle west for lack of money. That afternoon my evening paper contained an able letter presenting a remedy which I shall describe later.

It is a matter of common knowledge that cities generally throughout the country have assumed new functions undreamed-of fifty years ago; that the demand for money was growing rapidly before the dollar began to decline and that since 1915 with a dollar worth sixty cents the demand for dollars has exceeded the power of cities to supply them for services that are essential. The census report of 1919 in the record of the chief 146 cities of the country shows the debt of these cities in 1903 as $933,000,000; sixteen years later $2,541,000,000. The per capita debt in 1903 was $44 and in 1919 $81. The per capita cost of government in cities in 1903 was $24 and in 1919 $35. That is a period of only sixteen years and the dollar had not declined to the bottom in 1919 nor had expenditures risen in proportion to the extent to which they have to-day.

[1] Mr. Purdy generously consented to fill a vacancy on the program which arose three days before the meeting.—ED.

THE CITY MUST BE FREE

The cities of the United States are in no position to meet these new demands by efficiency of service or by grants of money. Thirty years ago city government was deemed the disgrace of the nation. After twenty-five years Frederic C. Howe saw cities as the hope of democracy. And so they are; but they must be free to do their work.

The causes for the lack of intelligence in city government and for the ack of power in city government lie deep in the history of the last hundred

years. Very naturally our people were afraid of autocratic power. This led to the election rather than the appointment of public officers. They wanted to be sure that the people retained all the power they could. In the '30's and '40's of the last century there was a tremendous demand for public improvements and an era of extravagance. The people became afraid of their elected representatives, and state constitutions from 1850 on show the effect of this fear. Instead of following the model of the Constitution of the United States with its beautiful simplicity, constitutions began to contain every conceivable thing. They were full of prohibitions and statutory directions. Some of the constitutions limit tax rates for state, county, and local purposes. When the constitution does not contain such limits they are usually found in statutes so that it is the rule rather than the exception that cities in all states are controlled in their expenditures, and controlled within very narrow limits. The power of boards of aldermen was so curtailed that men of ability found little attraction in serving on such a board. When boards of aldermen were inefficient or corrupt there was a further excuse for depriving them of power. In the last few years great progress has been made by substituting a small board elected at large possessing larger powers than the board of aldermen elected by districts possessing very little power. At the same time in over 100 cities provision was made for a city manager with full power to administer the city government and carry out the policies determined by the small elected board. The fact that this plan of city government has spread in so short a time to so many cities is proof of its success. There are dangers. Among them is the weakness of the selection of the commission to govern a city by districts instead of at large. If the commission is elected at large there is the danger of a division of the electorate on lines of national policy and the use of a commission to further the ends of a national political party rather than the welfare of the citizens of the city.

NO AUTOMATIC CURE

In human affairs there is no panacea that will work automatically. Nothing can take the place of intelligent, active participation in public affairs by all the citizens who have an interest in the city, but obstacles can be removed and some methods have been proved successful. Cities must be freed from constitutional restraints. They must be more free than they are to make their own charters, develop their own policies, and govern themselves without state interference.

There is a further remedy, that to which I referred as contained in the letter to my New York newspaper. In this was advocated proportional representation for the election of city commissions. By proportional representation every group of sufficient size can elect its own representative. A strong tendency will be exerted upon every group of voters to put forward such candidates as are most likely to secure the votes of others than the immediate group proposing them. A good commissioner would be certain of re-election.

Proportional representation is not an untried mode of election. It has been in use for a number of years in several countries and has been tried with success in some cities of the United States. It offers to-day the most promising method of improving city government. It would make city government so much more stable that the reluctance of legislatures to confer

adequate powers of city government would be lessened.

We know that in our cities there is the patriotism, ability, and character to run our cities better than any private corporations are run. All we lack is the appropriate means of accomplishing the end that we all desire.

CAMP ROOSEVELT—BOY BUILDER

A PART OF CHICAGO'S PUBLIC SCHOOL SYSTEM

BY LILLIAN EWERTSEN

"Nobody ever took any interest in me when I was a boy. Nobody ever told me things." That is the story which is heard on all sides in court rooms to-day, where criminals are being tried for breaking laws.

Careful analysis shows that the majority of lawbreakers do wrong not so much because of their knowledge of what is wrong, but because of their *lack* of knowing what is right. They have never been taught the right thing to do, as citizens.

Educators have for some time past been studying ways and means for the inclusion of a thorough course in citizenship training in the public schools. The Chicago public school system has gone further, and has established at Camp Roosevelt, during the summer vacation months, a great outdoor camp where boys may spend a healthful, enjoyable life "roughing it," and at the same time receive the benefits of a thorough course in citizenship building which sends close to a thousand boys home at the end of the season with a well-defined knowledge of law and order, of respect for American institutions, with respect for the rights of others, and respect of self. The better citizenship training enters into every phase of camp activity, and is an undercurrent which is felt more than seen. All of the one hundred and more officers, instructors, etc., who compose the staff of the Camp Roosevelt organization, start their instruction with the idea of "building better boys."

WAR DEPARTMENT CO-OPERATES

At the head of the camp, and constantly directing its activities, is Major F. L. Beals, U. S. A., the founder and commanding officer. Because he wanted to reach the red-blooded American lad in all corners of the country, (not a select few), he sought and secured the support of national organizations to bring about this great boy-building institution.

As a result, the war department assists in its maintenance by the loan of complete camping equipment, and the assignment of United States army officers and non-commissioned officers for instruction purposes. The American Red Cross has established a hospital, and a staff of doctors and nurses to look after the health and sanitation of the camp, in addition to offering courses in First Aid and Red Cross. The Y. M. C. A. operates a completely equipped "Y" hut and ten secretaries remain on duty during the entire summer to look after the welfare and comfort of the boys, and to assist in ath-

letic and entertainment programs. To cement the whole, the Chicago public school system has made the camp an auxiliary of the Chicago summer schools. The summer school faculty in charge of the schools division, which includes seventh and eighth grade and complete high school courses, is selected in the main from the Chicago schools. Credits are honored on a par with those of other Chicago summer schools, and are recognized by educators throughout the country. Last summer, the camp schools were added to the list of accredited schools of the Indiana state board of public instruction.

Further backing for the camp was secured by public-spirited Chicago business men, who have formed the Camp Roosevelt Association, for the purpose of securing, through donation, the necessary funds to carry on the camp each summer. Mr. Angus S. Hibbard is chairman of the Camp Roosevelt Association. With such whole-hearted support on the part of the affiliating organizations, it is possible to offer boys the finest kind of a summer outing, under expert instruction, with the best of care and the best of food, at a fraction of the usual cost for such privileges. The only requisite for attendance is that a boy must be ten years of age or over, and possess a clean moral character.

CAMP WELL LOCATED

There are three avenues which boys may follow in the training courses. The summer schools division is for boys who have fallen behind in their school studies, and who desire to make up credits. The R. O. T. C. or military division is for older boys who prefer simply the outdoor, health-building program, and the junior camp is for younger lads. Each boy has his own job to do, and he is taught how by men whose devotion to their work wins the respect and admiration of every boy with whom they come in contact.

To insure the best results in training, the camp is sufficiently far removed from the main thoroughfares as to provide absolute privacy, yet near enough to provide for the daily delivery of fresh fruits, vegetables and meats. The camp site is a picturesque one, on Silver Lake, Indiana, eight miles east of LaPorte, and sixty-five miles from Chicago on the New York Central lines. Being within such easy access of the great railroad terminals is a deciding factor in favor of the location, as it enables boys from all directions to make good connections. The many buildings on the grounds were formerly occupied by a boarding school for boys, and so are admirably adapted for the convenience and comfort of the campers. The property was laid out by landscape gardeners, who did much to intensify the natural beauty of the spot.

The proper functioning of the mess hall in providing the very best food is assured by maintaining a mess officer, who has under his charge twenty-one cooks, pastry cooks, vegetable cleaners and peelers, assistants, dishwashers, etc. The large mess hall, capable of accommodating one thousand at a time, functions with absolute perfection, and the end of each meal finds hundreds of healthy, growing lads happy and contented, with not a word of complaint about the food—rather a phenomenal record, when you stop to consider boys.

Major Beals occupies the position of supervisor of physical education in the public high schools of Chicago, and in this capacity comes in daily contact with hundreds of growing boys. He is well versed in boy psychology, having made this his life study. It is his

pleasure to advise, counsel and aid parents, where desired, in working out their "boy problems."

Those of us who are interested in progressive civic movements will find in a thorough study of the Camp Roosevelt Plan surprisingly new developments which will do much to assist boys taking the courses in becoming better future American citizens.

A NATIONAL AGENCY OF MUNICIPAL RESEARCH

BY STEPHEN CHILD
Washington, D. C.

PROFESSOR MERRIAM'S illuminating paper, *The Next Step in the Organization of Municipal Research*, in the September, 1922, number of the REVIEW, is important and timely. With his general thesis the writer is heartily in accord. Professor Merriam gives a clear outline of the more or less intelligent but quite inco-ordinate effort of the past, that has collected but by no means digested a great mass of municipal facts and makes the following pertinent statement: "There is no central co-ordinating agency available for the purpose of interpreting and applying this mass of facts and conclusions to the problems of municipal government in the broader sense of the term . . . no adequate central *clearing house for interchange of information*, and for mature analysis and interpretation of all the various types of data collected" and asks "is it not worth while considering whether some more effective device for *interchange of information* might be developed than we have at present?"[1]

The writer believes just such a device or agency is at the present moment in the throes of "bein abornin," so to speak, and that readers of the REVIEW will be interested to know more about its aim and ambitions. The name of this organization, "L'Union Internationale des Villes" (The International Union of Cities), does not fully express its purpose. The facts are that with headquarters in Brussels and "Centers" organizing in Paris, London, Amsterdam, Dusseldorf, Rome, Washington, as well as in many other countries, there is forming what will become in effect *an international clearing house of civic information.* From all over the world, contemporary information, of all kinds, relating to civic affairs is being collected, studied, briefed, classified for convenient use and distributed to all progressive cities, as well as organizations and individuals interested in civic advance.[2]

This "Infant Prodigy,"—it is admittedly weak at present but its sponsors believe it to be capable of

[1] The italics are by the writer.

[2] The author was present at the initial meetings in Brussels in 1920 and prepared a more extended account of this organization which appeared in the Survey of January 21, 1922, under the title "An International Clearing House of Civic Information." Furthermore he has been at the central office a portion of the past two summers and is now in Washington helping forward the establishment of the proposed American Center. He would be glad to answer further inquiries which can be addressed to him, 410 Maryland Bldg., Washington, D. C.

accomplishing a prodigious amount of good work,—is, like all such endeavors in their early stages, greatly in need of financial nourishment. In Europe this is being supplied through National Unions of Cities. There, municipalities join officially, subscribing through their National Unions a fee depending upon the population of the town and agreeing also to contribute all important data and published documentation in regard to their own local conditions. Here in America this did not seem feasible and while in the early stages of our investigation it was thought possible that some private organization might sponsor the project, the consensus of opinion now is that while it may be necessary to have private aid for a time, the problem as a whole is much more properly one for the government to solve, that in fact it falls quite properly within the field of what might be termed a civic affairs service admittedly so much needed and let us hope some day to be attained.

An important step in this direction was taken by the preparation and presentation some months ago of the Tinkham bill which would have established a bureau of housing, town planning and living conditions that would have done many of the things Professor Merriam would like to have done. This effort fell by the wayside for various reasons, among others, because official Washington does not look favorably upon the creation of more bureaus. Nevertheless Secretary Hoover has taken a splendid step forward in this direction by creating in his department the division of building and housing. The helpful results already obtained by this division, its work in regard to zoning, housing and kindred matters is important and fully appreciated by the country.

A committee of the American Society of Landscape Architects, of which the writer is chairman, has raised a small fund and employed Miss Theodora Kimball, librarian of the School of Landscape Architecture and City Planning of Harvard University, to make a thorough study of conditions in Washington. Miss Kimball finds that all the material needed for an American Center of Civic Documentation is readily available in Washington, principally at the Library of Congress, and that it will be unnecessary, therefore, to spend any money on this account. This is important not only as regards expense but as justifying the original thought of organizing the American Center in Washington rather than in any other city or under any other auspices. Nowhere else is such a complete collection of civic data to be found or assembled at so slight expenditure.

She finds furthermore that trained assistants from the above mentioned division may be permitted by the Library of Congress and other sources to have all this material set aside for study and briefing and that by this means the collection and preparation of American briefs similar to those now being prepared in Europe can and, it is believed, will soon be started.

With regard to furnishing America's contribution toward the expense of the central office in Brussels, and thereby enabling American cities and citizens interested in civic development to receive the invaluable material which they are now collecting and distributing there, Mr. Hoover, who is interested, has written us as follows:

> However valuable co-operation with the Union might be, I can see no way for this department to contribute to the support of the Union without the specific approval of congress.

Our investigations prove that for various reasons it may not be possible to obtain such approval and govern-

ment appropriation for the present,—that this may, however, readily come later when the value of the effort is more firmly established. Our committee is therefore at the present time endeavoring to arrange for temporary aid from a private fund and it is believed these efforts will be fruitful. We are confident that once started, even in this admittedly meager manner, results will justify larger funds that will enable ampler returns.

SCOPE OF PROGRAM OF OUR ANNUAL MEETINGS

REPORT OF COMMITTEE TO CONSIDER THE SUBJECT

This report was accepted by the Council on March 28, and ordered referred to the Program Committee. :: :: :: :: :: ::

FOLLOWING a revision of the constitution and by-laws of the National Municipal League looking to a general extension of the League's activities, the executive committee on December 28, 1916, passed the following resolution which was approved by the council on April 10, 1917:

WHEREAS, municipal progress is reaching the point where it is increasingly embarrassed by the relative backwardness of state and county government.

Resolved, that the League shall hereafter devote such time and attention as may be practicable to the problems of state and county government.

In accordance with this resolution, the programs of the annual meetings of the League have been planned to include county and state government within their scope. For example, the program for the twenty-eighth annual meeting at Philadelphia held on November 22–24, 1922, included the following:

Pennsylvania Under the Microscope

1. System of state education
2. The administration of charities and corrections
3. Pennsylvania road system

New Standards of Public Employment

1. The Wisconsin idea of personnel administration
2. Civil service from the viewpoint of the administrator
3. Progress in selective tests in public employment
4. Report of committee on new standards of municipal employment

Problem of Criminal Justice

1. Deficiencies in criminal justice
2. Detroit succeeds under a new organization
3. How Cleveland is cashing in on its crime survey

Our National Budget

1. A business man's viewpoint of the budget
2. How the new budget operates
3. The controller general and his opportunities

Reporting Government

1. The other side of the budget
2. Informing people about their government
3. Municipal exhibits

What's the Matter with Congress?

1. A criticism of congressional procedure
2. How Congress transacts its business
3. Proposal for legislative leadership

These topics, with the exception of "Our National Budget" and "What's

the Matter with Congress?" deal with city, county, and state government, or all three, and are obviously within the meaning of the resolution of April 10, 1917. However, criticism has arisen because two sessions out of six related directly to Federal matters and only indirectly to local or state government. As a result, a resolution was adopted by a mail referendum on December 20, 1922, as follows:

Resolved, that a committee of five be appointed by the president of the League to consider and report upon the relative attention which should be given at future meetings of the organization to municipal affairs on one hand, and to state and national affairs on the other.

In compliance with this resolution, the president of the League appointed a committee of the following persons:

Prof. John A. Fairlie, University of Illinois
Mayo Fessler, City Club of Chicago
Prof. Charles E. Merriam, University of Chicago
Hon. Morton D. Hull, Chicago.
Lent D. Upson, Detroit Bureau of Governmental Research

The secretary of the National Municipal League has submitted a series of questions, based upon individual conversations with members of the committee, to guide the committee in its consideration. The questions with epitomized replies of the committee are as follows:

1. With respect to the proportion of attention devoted to state and national governments, did the Philadelphia program violate the spirit of the resolution adopted by the Executive Committee on December 28, 1916, and approved by the council on April 10, 1917?

The committee believes that the program was somewhat overbalanced by devoting two of six sessions to a discussion of Federal questions, even though secondarily related to local problems.

2. Is it in accord with the above resolution to give place on the program to discussions of federal questions which are similar in form to those existing in municipal and state government?

The committee believes that there is no reason why such departure in a moderate degree may not be made, particularly if it secures men of prominence as speakers.

3. Will larger groups be attracted to our meetings by limiting discussion to municipal subjects with little or no attention to county and state matters? In particular, can we persuade larger numbers of city officials to attend without doing injustice to those old members of the League who regularly attend our meetings? If so, how?

The committee has not believed that limiting the programs to purely municipal matters will increase attendance, and feels that county affairs should certainly be discussed along with such state problems as bear on local questions, or are of substantial concern.

4. Do you favor the proposal that the National Municipal League and the Governmental Research Conference hold their meetings jointly instead of separately as at present?

The committee urges that such combined meeting be held, and that the American Political Science Association be included if that can be arranged.

5. What is the proper ratio on the program between municipal, county and state subjects?

The committee believes that fully one half of the program should be centered on municipal government, the balance to be divided to county, state, and Federal questions, with the reservation that this recommended division may be modified in event of the Governmental Research Conference meeting with the League, and providing an independent program limited to municipal matters.

6. How far should local desires, which may modify the above ratio, be followed in deciding program topics?

The committee believes that local desires should modify the general rule, but only to a limited extent.

In summary, your committee reports that it finds a small overemphasis given to state and national affairs at the recent Philadelphia meeting, although

this finding should not imply that these subjects should not be discussed, particularly when they have a bearing upon local questions; that possibly one half of the program should, in the future, be devoted to purely urban problems, leaving the other half to be distributed between county, state, and national questions; that it is highly desirable that the National Municipal League and the Governmental Research Conference meet jointly with some equitable division of time between them, and that the emphasis of the League program should be modified by the nature of the program of the Governmental Research Conference; that some respect should, of course, be paid to local wishes in arranging the program, but not so extensively as to restrict nation-wide interest; and that these findings are in no way meant as a reflection upon the judgment of the program committee in charge of the Philadelphia program or upon the secretary of the League, and are set forth only as a suggestion to future program committees and the secretary in formulating League programs.

Respectfully submitted,

LENT D. UPSON,
Chairman.

BUREAU OF PUBLIC PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

A CO-OPERATIVE ORGANIZATION TO IMPROVE PUBLIC SERVICE

BY W. F. WILLOUGHBY
Director, Institute for Government Research, Washington

FOR years the civil service commissions of the country have felt the need of a central organization to assist them in keeping in touch with each other's activities and to aid them in working out the many technical problems they have to meet. Following several years of effort on the part of civil service administrators success has finally been achieved in providing such an organization. The new organization is known as the Bureau of Public Personnel Administration and is attached to the Institute for Government Research, the director of the latter institution serving ex officio as the director of the new Bureau. Provision for the financial support of the Bureau has been secured for a period of three years and it is expected that little difficulty will be encountered for its continued support thereafter.

PLAN OF ORGANIZATION

Though the Bureau is attached to the Institute for Government Research, it will maintain its separate identity and will be under the general direction of a special advisory board of five which has been established with power to pass upon and approve or reject proposals for activities undertaken, to review in manuscript formal reports and publications, and to approve or reject staff nominations. This advisory board consists of William Gorham Rice, chairman of the New York state civil service commission and Charles P. Messick, chief examiner and secretary of the New

Jersey civil service commission, both designated by the Assembly of Civil Service Commissions; George R. Wales, of the United States civil service commission, designated by that commission; Richard H. Dana, president of the National Civil Service Reform League, designated by that organization; and Robert M. Yerkes, chairman of the research information service of the National Research Council, designated by that body. The advisory board is so chosen as to be representative not only of civil service administrators but also of those interested in the improvement and extension of the merit system and of those organized for the purpose of encouraging the use of scientific research methods in the study of public personnel problems.

THE PURPOSES

More specifically the purposes of the Bureau as they have been formulated are:

1. To serve as a clearing house for existing information relating to personnel administration in the public service, national, state, county, and local.

2. To develop and improve methods of personnel administration through the conduct of original investigations and experiments.

3. To publish the results of its work in such form as experience may demonstrate to be most effective for the improvement of the personnel administration of the public service.

The Bureau has begun work and is now collecting the data needed both for its clearing house service and for the special studies that it will undertake. The scope of its work may perhaps best be indicated by a brief description of work now under way. Obviously the first activity has of necessity been to secure from civil service commissions definite information as to the laws and rules under which they operate, the appropriations made for their work, the organization of their staffs, the forms they use, the tests they are holding, and the manner in which they handle their various transactions. A considerable amount of material has already been gathered and classified so as to be available for instant use in answer to requests made by any commission for specific information or advice. This material also serves as the basis for several studies now under way or to be undertaken later.

IMPROVED TESTS

Such an organization as the Bureau of Public Personnel Administration must, of course, devote much of its attention to the improvement of civil service tests. The first studies concerning tests naturally deal with those regarding which civil service administrators are not now fully satisfied and where the chance for betterment are considerable. Among the studies now under way are a comparative study of police tests, a study of clerical tests, intelligence tests, a study of stenographer-secretary tests, objective examination methods particularly as developed and used by psychologists, graphic methods of determining the value of tests, the development of performance and picture trade tests for use in selecting employees in the skilled and semi-skilled trade groups, the stencil method of rating test papers, the principles of oral tests, the key word principle in oral tests, and the reliability and validity of tests. In carrying on these studies the co-operation of a number of city, state, and federal civil service commissions has been secured and the data that commissions have already accumulated are being made use of to the fullest possible extent.

Following visits of staff members to a number of commissions in the eastern part of the country and an analysis of

the data collected, a number of studies relating to civil service procedure have been started. These deal with such matters as announcing and advertising tests, making certifications, checking payrolls, establishing and maintaining general and special files, and the use of visible indexes and other labor-saving devices.

EDUCATION EQUIVALENTS

Another kind of study which the Bureau will undertake as soon as some of the more pressing problems are out of the way is the determination of the equivalent of a high school and a college education. This is a problem that confronts civil service administrators at almost every turn and in addition is of great interest to educators. There is no assurance that such equivalents can be determined without reference to professional and technical courses, even though it is known that some persons with superior mentality, through their reading and experience, have the same mental maturity as is ordinarily acquired through high school and college training, while others who have had the formal educational courses fail to show the mental maturity which might reasonably be expected from their training. Nevertheless an attempt will be made to work out tests which, without reference to any particular school subject, will be such as to show that persons taking them either do or do not possess a certain degree of mental maturity.

A number of other studies have been planned but the requests for assistance on particular problems from civil-service commissions, in connection with the studies now under way, will probably require the full time of the staff members during most of the remainder of 1923. The co-operation of civil service commissions in the studies undertaken and their prompt responses to requests for data are very gratifying to those who worked for several years to establish such an organization as the Bureau. The number of requests for assistance already received from both strong and weak commissions is ample evidence that the new organization fills a long-felt need.

BETTER HOMES WEEK[1]

BY JOHN M. GRIES

Chief Division of Building and Housing Department of Commerce

Better Homes Week will be here in June. Read about the one in 1922 and how to make the next one a success in your town. Last year 961 communities put on demonstrations. :: :: :: :: ::

More than five hundred communities provided demonstration houses for public inspection during Better Homes Week in October, 1922. These communities were scattered throughout every section of the country, from New Haven, Connecticut, to Tucson, Arizona; from Spokane, Washington, to St. Helena Island, South Carolina; and from Port Huron, Michigan, to Biloxi, Mississippi. In all, several hundred thousand people visited these

[1] Contributed at the request of the American Civic Association.

houses and saw what better housing means.

As a rule these houses were well chosen to illustrate better housing conditions and improved designs. They were furnished and supplied with household equipment. The time between the announcement and the actual demonstration during Better Homes Week was very short so that it was difficult to obtain the houses which would best lend themselves to a demonstration. With few exceptions the cost of the houses ranged between $4,000 and $15,000. In most communities an earnest effort was made to maintain a reasonable balance between the cost of the house, the cost of the various items of furniture, and the cost of the equipment. In a few communities, however, the good effects of the demonstration were largely lost because some group succeeded in overemphasizing its part.

The educational value of these demonstration houses was well worth the effort put forth. Both by example and by discussion the importance of good light and ventilation, satisfactory floor plans, durable material, and good workmanship, was brought home to thousands of families; as well as the value of open spaces around the house, and the arrangement of the kitchen to save unnecessary steps.

With the importance of the home, it is fitting that we observe a Better Homes Week; and that all communities afford their people an opportunity to see a small, well-equipped home which the average citizen can afford to live in or to own. The demonstration must be educational, never purely commercial. It seems impossible to present a well-balanced home at modest cost if the demonstration is controlled by one or a few commercial groups only. To be successful it requires the co-operation of the civic, philanthropic and business interests of the community.

The prime mover in last year's effort was Mrs. William B. Meloney, editor of the *Delineator*. The 1922 plan was initiated during the summer and put through at a time when many of the people who would handle the demonstrations were away on vacations. For this reason a number of communities that were in hearty sympathy with the movement were unable to take part. This year the announcement has been made several months in advance of the date set, June 4 to June 10.

Last year the movement had the endorsement of President Harding, Vice-President Coolidge, Secretary Hoover, Secretary Wallace, Secretary Davis, and other federal officials. It was also endorsed by more than thirty governors of states.

An advisory council of seventeen was selected to serve in an advisory capacity, to pass upon policies, to see that the work was educational in character, and that the objects should be attained. The advisory council consisted of the following:

Calvin Coolidge, vice-president;
Herbert Hoover, secretary of commerce;
Henry C. Wallace, secretary of agriculture;
James John Davis, secretary of labor;
Dr. Hugh S. Cumming, surgeon-general, U. S. public health service;
Dr. John James Tigert, U. S. commissioner of education;
C. W. Pugsley, assistant secretary of agriculture:
John M. Gries, chief, division of building and housing;
Julius H. Barnes, president, Chamber of Commerce of the U. S.;
John Ihlder, manager, civic development department, Chamber of Commerce of the U. S.;
Donn Barber, fellow, American Institute of Architects;

John Barton Payne, chairman, central committee, American Red Cross;
Livingston Farrand, chairman, National Health Council;
Mrs. Thomas G. Winter, president general, Federation of Women's Clubs;
Mrs. Lena Lake Forrest, president, National Federation of Business and Professional Women's Clubs;
Mrs. Charles Schuttler, chairman, woman's division, Federation of Farm and Home Bureaus; and
Mrs. Clara Sears Taylor, director of the rent commission, District of Columbia.

While Better Homes Week had the endorsement of national and state officials, and the heads of national associations of social, philanthropic, and business interests, the success of the movement depended upon the various local communities. Either through a selfish or social interest everybody is interested in better homes. Many communities showed a surprising public spirit—sometimes more than seventy different organizations joined in an effort to present a furnished house so that all could learn more about what a well-arranged and furnished house should be.

In some of the larger cities two houses were used. In this way more people can be reached. One house may aid greatly the families with incomes ranging from $1,500 to $2,500; and the other be of great interest to those with incomes ranging from $2,500 to $5,000. These income figures may be varied with the communities.

In the smaller cities one house is enough. The cost of the house and furnishings should be in keeping with the possibilities of the community. While the house and furnishings should probably be superior to that which most families can afford, it should not be too far beyond their reach. Otherwise it will tend to discourage, and lose much of its effective educational value.

Better housing includes so much that no single demonstration can completely cover all phases of the problem. While the entire demonstration should be sound from a housing standpoint, special emphasis can be directed towards that which the local community needs most. In no demonstration can the health features be neglected. Light and air are essential and no house should be used as a demonstration without adequate light and air. In some houses the emphasis was placed on the open space surrounding the house, in others the floor space of the house, in others the kitchen, while in others it was the color scheme, the furniture, and the lighting. All of these features may be emphasized but not so far that the visitor gets a distorted idea of a well-balanced budget for himself.

A plan book was prepared which served as a guide to the various committees organized in the cities. It covered the organization, selection of the house, house plans, the furniture, decorations, programs. Many new ideas were presented by visitors as well as demonstrators. Some of these were embodied in the new plan book which has been prepared for the coming demonstration, under the direction of Mrs. William B. Meloney, 223 Spring Street, New York City.

THE NATIONAL MUNICIPAL LEAGUE IN RETROSPECT AND PROSPECT

BY CLINTON ROGERS WOODRUFF

Address before the Annual Dinner of the National Municipal League, Wednesday, November 22, 1922. :: :: :: :: :: ::

PHILADELPHIA, the cradle of American liberty, was likewise the birthplace and the cradle, nay more for a quarter of a century the home of the National Municipal League. Twenty-eight years have come and gone since the League was organized in this city. They have been filled with unceasing activities in behalf of the welfare, yes, I may say "the higher welfare of American cities."

I

At the beginning we were filled with indignation that we merited the scathing indictment of that sincere friend of America, the lamented and the revered James Bryce. For once, at least, our indignation was directed at the cause, rather than at the revealer. We did not hold him responsible for what his searchlight of inquiry revealed. We felt the truth of the indictment and set about putting our houses in better order.

After several years of painstaking endeavor to ascertain what were the underlying causes of our troubles, came the steps towards a constructive program—the formulation of the first "Municipal Program," founded upon the principle that the individual municipality should be freed from the shackles of state domination and given liberty to deal in its own way with matters that are its own peculiar concern, to determine the details of its own housekeeping, so that each city under its own roof could live its own life, develop its own policy, mold its own character, in short the program embodied real municipal home rule.

Details were filled in from year to year and then came the formulation of the New Municipal Program embodying the developments of the generation and establishing the prototype of efficient municipal framework —the city-manager form of government.

Coincident with this constructive work of the first quarter of century of our life there was an unremitting insistence upon the duties of citizenship. It was all very well to work out a model framework, but if it was to be used by an indifferent or sluggish community, the real progress would be slight. Real self-government is not a matter of form, it is a matter of habit, of instinct, of soul. No alchemy of a program can take the place of the self-governing instinct. No form of municipal perpetual motion has been devised as a substitute for the patient, everyday discharge of the personal duties of citizenship.

II

I know there are those who will call this obvious, self-evident, platitudinous. That may be true, but until it becomes the settled habit of a community, those who are concerned in its welfare will overlook it at their peril. And right here may I utter a

word of caution—avoid professionalism. In the early days of the League and I sometimes feel they were the most fruitful, certainly in arousing public interest, there were no salaried officials, the budget was small, but the sincere co-operation of men and women devoted to the cause produced results of far-reaching significance.

Another word of caution is: Avoid superior airs, avoid holding aloof. Above all things keep in touch with the people, the common people. Here the practical politician teaches us a lesson we greatly need to learn.

Not long since the retiring United States Senator from Mississippi said that "the fellow who refers to sentiment contemptuously and who wants to find dollars, shillings and pence in every proposition that he can present to the public is not worthy of other men's admiration," and he might have added, "nor worthy of their emulation." We need more sentiment in our public work, more sentiment in our work for the public.

I have been deeply impressed by the frequency with which I have seen these glowing words of Temple Scott, printed and reprinted in civic publications. At the risk of reiteration I repeat them:

> The picture once painted or the poem sung, it stands henceforth by itself; the artist can do no more for it. It must live or die without further help from him. But the city is never thus entirely separated from us, its builders. It remains tied to us by the invisible cord of nourishing passions. It grows with us or it dies with us. It is in a more real and personal sense a part of us, as we are of it. It becomes then the reflex of the lives and aspirations of the people who dwell in it. So that a city—its streets, its highways, its buildings, its public places, as well as its business and life—is an embodiment of ourselves. It is this living spirit that may hearten and inspire us; that may delight and enchant us and that may also break and destroy us.

Let us adopt this conception of the city during the coming years. Let us, while giving all due heed to forms and details, lend our energies and activities to developing the content of our city. Let our city be known as "the city that serves." The highest duty of the city is the cause of humanity and therein lies the future of our League. As was recently said, "The government of a people actuated by nothing higher than grossly material considerations—the monetary and the selfish values—faces extinction by moral collapse."

Our outstanding policy of the first quarter of a century was the policy of appreciation as opposed to the policy of depreciation. We sought the good and emphasized it. When we saw the bad we sought to put something better in its place. Who was it that said: "I know two men, one of whom is very happy and one of whom is very miserable. The essential difference between them is that one loves the beauty of the world and the other hates its ugliness."

III

There are many distinctive and individual planks to be inserted in a New Municipal Program, but it has not been my purpose to enumerate them in this connection. I have sought rather to suggest certain tendencies and certain fundamentals. For I believe as Rosenthal has put it that "in order to know the soul of a city, instead of looking upon it from the outside, it is necessary to sympathize, to examine as a physiologist would examine and to push the analysis to the moment when one seizes the secret of its life. When one has felt the pulsing of its heart and of its arteries, then one can truly judge it. The public squares, the monuments, the streets, and the parks, appear to us, then, for what they really are,—as organs that are articulated or dis-

jointed, discordant or harmonious. We are pleased by unity and displeased by a lack of coherence. We desire a perfect adaptation of means to ends and, in truth, from such adaptation should spring the essential beauty of the city."

And the end is to build up useful, helpful, happy citizens at all times interested in the public welfare and willing to work for its promotion and perpetuation. As the Los Angeles City Club maintains: good men, if uninformed, misinformed, or misguided, often cause a lot of mischief. Goodness alone cannot prevent bad government or insure good government. Ignorance, poverty, sickness and injustice are largely responsible for vice and sin. The forces that cause or aggravate ignorance, poverty, sickness and injustice are increasingly social rather than personal. Any successful attack upon vice and sin must therefore mobilize such forces as education, employment, sanitation, recreation, food and water supply, proper housing and eugenics. The one agency, the Club declares, through which the community as a whole can act is the government — municipal, state and national.

Government waste and inefficiency are mainly due to poor organization, defective equipment, narrow-gauge policy, and bad management, rather than to dishonesty or wicked intention, and herein is where the question of machinery becomes pertinent.

By reason of such waste and inefficiency, municipal, state and national governments are causing or permitting more ignorance, sickness, poverty, misery and vice than all other social agencies combined can cure—unless they work through and upon the government and utilize its vast resources, or to put it in the words of the Mayor of Manchester:

> The growth of municipal responsibilities illustrates the irresistible drift of public affairs. The democratic ideal is being worked out through municipalities. For what are free libraries, art galleries, baths, parks, technical schools, tramways but community efforts? We need some stimulus to quicken our sense of the value of mutual helpfulness. Some day men and women will awake to the immense possibilities of corporate action; and the community will find salvation, not in the patronage and gifts of the wealthy, but in the combined and intelligent efforts of the people themselves.

THE TOLEDO COMMISSION OF PUBLICITY AND EFFICIENCY

BY C. A. CROSSER

Secretary of the Commission

A combination reference library and research bureau for government and people. :: :: :: :: :: :: :: :: ::

THE Publicity and Efficiency Commission of the city of Toledo combines the following functions:

1. Municipal reference library.
2. Governmental research bureau.
3. Information office on city statistics.
4. Official printer and repository of city reports and records.
5. Laboratory for Toledo University and high school civics class pupils.
6. Publishers of the Toledo *City Journal*, official organ of the municipality, which contains "fact" articles on current legislation, council proceedings, legislation, various departmental reports and legal advertisements.

The commission is performing some of these functions well and some not so thoroughly because of a lack of adequate facilities but, borrowing the maxim of Coué, it is becoming more and more effective daily. All of the above functions were not laid out for the commission with its inception in the 1916 charter. They have been taken on from time to time as the need arose, but they come within the powers given the commission by the charter.

Here are the duties of the commission as provided in the charter:

1. To investigate any and all departments in order to determine the degree of efficiency with which public service is being rendered.

2. To recommend to members of council and other officers, methods, devices and systems by which in the judgment of the commission, the business of the city could be transacted with greater economy and efficiency.

3. To acquire and record information it may collect touching on the betterment of civic conditions and the development of improved and economical municipal administration elsewhere and to embody such data in its reports and recommendations, and publish same in the *City Journal*.

4. To edit, print and distribute all municipal records, reports and documents including an annual summary of the work of the administrative departments.

5. To collect and supply information for all officers and departments and to acquire for any officer at his request, information concerning any matter of interest within the scope of his official duties and to advise with such officer concerning same.

In several ways the commission has not entirely fulfilled the high anticipations of the framers of the charter. It was expected that taxpayers, ever complaining about high taxes, would subscribe by the tens of thousands to the *City Journal*, the municipal publication which would show them how their money was being spent and recommend economies. In spite of a vigorous circulation campaign, the subscription list since 1916 never has exceeded two thousand. In the last two years it has been gaining steadily due to a rising wave of civic interest developed through the neighborhood welfare and commercial organizations.

SPECIAL STUDIES

With the limited facilities at its disposal, the commission on its own initiative and at the request of department heads has made a number of special studies. Notable among these were: intercepting sewer system, welfare workhouse farm, city-owned automobiles, municipal court, crime survey, investigation of the health department, and study of the parole system. Besides these many minor studies have been made which have appeared in the *City Journal* from time to time.

Among the special studies made in 1922 were: zoölogical gardens, municipal auditoriums, power charges for high pressure fire stations, telephone rates in other cities, history of the civic center and city hall projects, survey of local grade crossing problem, curb gasoline stations and building inspection fees and license rates.

The secretary of the commission assisted the captain of the police traffic bureau in drafting a suggested traffic ordinance which embodies the latest safety measures. The commission classified the suggestions on traffic that came in letters from the public.

In the last three years, several important studies which should have come under the commission were done under the direction of the departments particularly affected. These surveys lost some of their effectiveness with council which interpreted administrative bias which might not have occurred had they been done by the commission.

A BENEFIT TO CITY OFFICIALS

It may be seen from the foregoing that most of the reports and surveys have been "information studies" which have attempted to enlighten members of council and administrative officers. A number of recommendations made by the commission in these reports have been adopted, but this body has not yet attempted to "put across" any sweeping reform. It feels that it has not yet come to its full strength when it would stand more of a chance of success.

So the main effort of the commission in the last few years has been along educational lines. It has aimed to get the confidence of city officials and to make them see the benefits that they could get from this bureau. It aimed to demonstrate to the general public its impartiality and the cold authenticity of its work. Its progress to the present may be measured by the fact that in 1916 (the year of its creation) council refused to appropriate funds to pay the salary of a secretary, but such appropriation is now made regularly. When this educational period has been crossed, and the confidence of council in the commission established, this body will be able to pursue a more aggressive policy of recommending definite improvements in the municipal fabric. This period seems to be near at hand.

One of the chief values of this commission from the standpoint of the public lies in the authority conferred on it by the charter of conducting an investigation of any department, should the necessity arise. Such action would only be limited by the fund for such an investigation that council might be induced to appropriate.

The commission was created in 1916 under the provisions of the new charter. Five commissioners who serve without compensation are appointed by the mayor. One term expires yearly, which removes it from election patronage. The paid secretary and a stenographic clerk complete the staff. The full commission meets monthly.

Wendell F. Johnson, now assistant

superintendent of the Toledo Social Service Federation, was secretary of this commission from 1917 until 1922. He was succeeded by the writer whose only qualifications were newspaper experience and intense interest in municipal affairs.

FIRST AID TO COUNCIL

It is a fact that there is not a council meeting when one or more council members does not appear armed with some fact or figure that has been supplied him by the Commission of Publicity and Efficiency. Sometimes the councilmen ask for it, but as frequently the data comes unsolicited from the commission and it is always appreciated.

In 1922 the commission whipped into shape and drafted 14 special reports by council subcommittees including those on smoke prevention, dance hall regulation, salary revision, safety building, professional bondsmen and similar matters.

Practically every one of the 52 issues of the *City Journal* in 1922 carried leading articles presenting the salient facts on the most important items of legislation then before council for consideration, anticipating the next meeting. These articles were written in an unbiased news vein and consisted of digests of material on hand in the reference library or the main arguments for and against the matter advanced at committee hearings.

Generally it appears that the most effective work may be done with the legislative body. Assistance is more welcomed by councilmen than by department heads who usually prefer to conduct their own investigations, possibly in order that they may control the conclusions. Furthermore it is in council that laws are made, it is here that they are tested in the light of the experience of other places and it is here that the arguments from both sides are weighed and sifted before they are finally passed.

AVENUES OF INFLUENCE

Naturally the penalty for quiet functioning behind the scenes has been a lack of knowledge of this bureau by the public. But in the last two years, close contact has been established with different neighborhood commercial and welfare organizations. At the present time, these small commercial clubs form the best avenue for reaching the public. The commission keeps their civic committees informed as to the progress of legislation affecting their vicinities.

Civics and municipal government classes from the high schools and the University of Toledo obtain much of their data for their topics from the reference library. Prof. O. Garfield Jones of the University of Toledo requires his municipal government students to read up on their topics in the office of the commission before they interview city officials. His advanced students are making studies that are particularly desired by council at this time and which are being done under the supervision of Professor Jones and the secretary of the commission.

Although a municipal reference library for the Commission of Publicity and Efficiency was not specifically contemplated by the framers of the charter, the character of the work of this office made the building up of such a library a necessity. More than 3,700 clippings were filed in 1922 including items from local newspapers, items from other municipal publications, annual reports and ordinances. This library continually is being referred to by city officials, particularly to ascertain the experiences and methods of other cities.

The commission has developed a

minor activity that is coming to be appreciated by officials. Many of these turn over to the commission the questionnaires which they receive from time to time. Generally the commission has the desired data which the bureau head may not have at hand. This relieves the latter of much work and at the same time insures carefully prepared returns.

It would seem that two factors are necessary for the effective functioning of a combination governmental reference library and research bureau—"sticking around" at all council and committee meetings to get acquainted with councilmen and gain their confidence and perceive first-hand what studies are needed, and to make these studies of practical service by completing them speedily as well as thoroughly before the issues become dead by being tabled or through a lapse of public interest.

COMMENTARY UPON THE COMPARATIVE BONDED DEBT OF THIRTY-SIX CITIES AS OF JANUARY 1, 1923

BY C. E. RIGHTOR

Of the Detroit Bureau of Governmental Research

To furnish certain general information about the bonded indebtedness of our largest cities, the Detroit Bureau of Governmental Research, through the cöoperation of the Governmental Research Conference and city officials throughout the country, has compiled these data for 36 of the largest cities.

The Committee on Non-Partisan Facts of the Institute for Public Service, New York City, reports that the bonded debt of our municipalities and states is over eleven billion dollars, and that a billion and a quarter of this amount were issued during the year 1922. When these facts are commonly known, and their significance appreciated, greater interest and watchfulness of public debt will be manifested.

The tabulation shows the gross amount of bonds outstanding as issued by each city, by classes of general, school, utility, and miscellaneous, except special assessments; the amount of sinking fund for such classes of bonds; and the net debt upon this basis. The per capita net debt and ranking of the cities are then given. The information is as of January 1, 1923, unless noted otherwise.

The tabulation is not concerned with state laws providing exemptions of certain issues of a city in computing its debt. Practices among the states are not uniform, and sometimes are absurd. Neither does it differentiate between whether the bonds were issued for a revenue-producing activity, or otherwise.

It has been suggested that special assessment bonds should be included as a part of the city's bonded debt. While it is recognized that such bonds are a liability of the city, they are short term bonds, usually offset in whole or in part by special assessments against the benefited or abutting property, and by law are omitted in calculations of the bonded debt. We omit any consideration of them.

Because of these conditions, there is no attempt made to have the resulting figures agree with official records of any city. It is desired only that they shall be correct as to the *total* by classes as above indicated, and are, therefore, *bonds outstanding in the name of the city.*

So condensed a compilation can record only totals, and it must be appreciated that only limited conclusions may be reached from the figures alone. A knowledge of conditions is necessary in each case. It is submitted that the most important desiderata relative to municipal debt are: First, that the bonds were issued for necessary public purposes; second, that the proceeds were economically expended; and third, that proper provision is being made for amortizing the bonds. The figures on debt do not afford this information.

Because a city shows a high per capita debt, there is no reflection against the city's financial policy or the capacity of its fiscal officers. A large part of the total debt may be for self-supporting investments, as Cincinnati's railway bonds of $20,000,000, or the water works in many of the cities listed. However, should the railroad or water works be wiped out by flood, fire or other cause, such city would continue to be back of the bonds.

Detroit is not to be condemned in its financial policy because during the past three years Controller Steffens has issued over $115,000,000 in bonds, $47,000,000 of this amount since January 1, 1922.

In noting Baltimore's debt, we cannot ignore the fact that the city receives revenues from its electrical conduits, and its wharves and docks. This condition, similarly, obtains in all the cities for most of those issues noted herein as "miscellaneous," as well as the several classes of utility bonds.

In the case of Boston, we must reflect that the property values back of the city and county debt are liable in major part for the Metropolitan District park, sewer, and water bonds amounting to several million dollars.

Toronto's debt may be classed as heavy, but examination discloses that the extensive investments in street railway, hydro-electric system, waterworks, and other utilities are self-sustaining.

Possibly the low debt of St. Louis means its public improvement program has been retarded,—at any event, in February (1923) the people voted bond issues of $87,372,500 for sewers and sanitation purposes, streets, lighting, hospitals, playgrounds, memorial plaza, auditorium, and water works.

Dayton is not to be condemned because, while its indebtedness is being reduced, its school district (the school district in Ohio is a separate political unit) has a small sinking fund, and because the property of that city has a burden of flood prevention bonds issued by the Miami Conservancy District (nine counties), in addition to the ordinary indebtedness.

That there is a relation between debt and the tax rate is apparent from examining these figures for Chicago and Norfolk, as examples. Chicago has a relatively small debt, due to a long established principle of building schools upon a "pay-as-you-go" basis—out of taxes—which makes the tax rate relatively high. Norfolk, however, enjoys a low tax rate, but its indebtedness is the highest of the cities listed, except for the Canadian cities. Denver is notable for its unusually low debt for general municipal purposes.

Omitting Washington with a per capita debt of 36 cents (this debt is the remainder of some 3.65 per cent bonds issued in 1874), the range in per capita debt is from $16.79 for St. Louis to

$206.60 for Norfolk, and $217.46 for Montreal. The average per capita debt is $103.40, and the median city, Pittsburgh, has a per capita debt of $93.03.

Obviously, the data presented are not as exhaustive as in the census bureau's *Financial Statistics of Cities*. On the other hand, the figures are more nearly current, and include the data for eleven cities omitted from the census bureau's reports for 1921. The omission of the financial data of 70 cities out of 253, in *Financial Statistics for Cities* for 1921 is deplored by the many who would use these data of our growing cities, with their increasingly complex financial problems,—by public officials, citizens, taxpayers, factory owners, bond buyers, students,—and is the result of an unfortunate application of economy by some Federal officials. This matter, however, is apart from this compilation.

If these figures of debt are of value, for the purposes indicated, their compilation is justified. This is the third annual compilation by the Detroit Bureau, and if there are any corrections, we hope that they will be called to our attention before future publications. Unfortunately, data were not received from four large cities,—Los Angeles, New Orleans, Jersey City, and Oakland,—but it is hoped to include them henceforth.

COMPARATIVE BONDED DEBT OF THIRTY-SIX CITIES, AS OF JANUARY 1, 1923

COMPILED BY THE DETROIT BUREAU OF GOVERNMENTAL RESEARCH, INC.
From Data Furnished by Members of the Governmental Research Conference, and City Officials
(Cents Omitted)

City	Census 1920	General Bonds	School Bonds	Public Utility Bonds	Miscellaneous Bonds	Gross Total Bonded Debt	Sinking Fund	Net Total Bonded Debt	Per Capita Net Debt	Rank
New York[1]	5,621,151	.....	.....	.....	.....	$1,730,160,385	$644,563,884	$1,085,596,501	$193.13	4
Chicago[2]	2,701,705	$107,858,300	$100,000	$5,395,500	.....	113,353,800	736,000	112,617,800	41.68	32
Philadelphia[3]	1,823,779	165,625,214	25,776,500	58,763,836	.....	250,165,550	54,859,535	195,306,015	107.09	14
Detroit[4]	993,739	62,377,216	36,693,600	43,089,114	.....	142,159,930	10,429,274	131,730,656	132.56	9
Cleveland[5]	796,836	69,580,524	28,425,000	25,096,000	.....	123,101,524	15,249,595	107,851,929	135.35	7
St. Louis	772,897	17,350,000	3,000,000	2,617,000	.....	22,967,000	9,995,000	12,972,000	16.79	35
Boston[6]	748,060	70,953,001	15,912,500	651,350	$39,123,700	126,640,551	42,599,632	84,040,919	112.34	11
Baltimore[7]	733,926	72,517,219	7,463,550	20,789,370	16,657,740	117,427,879	37,517,342	79,910,537	108.89	12
Pittsburgh	588,193	35,924,100	13,571,100	8,706,700	.....	58,201,900	3,481,200	54,720,700	93.03	19
San Francisco	508,410	23,045,300	7,055,000	40,908,100	.....	71,008,400	2,513,600	68,494,800	134.72	8
Buffalo	506,775	23,068,537	15,146,500	13,376,585	.....	51,591,622	5,391,560	46,200,062	91.16	20
Milwaukee	457,147	18,786,750	6,893,750	2,070,000	.....	27,750,500	3,478,923	24,271,577	53.09	29
Washington	437,571	4,701,200	.....	.....	.....	4,701,200	4,544,872	156,328	0.36	36
Newark	415,609	33,489,500	12,331,200	10,463,000	.....	56,283,700	12,537,688	43,746,012	105.25	16
Cincinnati[8]	401,247	54,850,551	8,928,550	15,002,130	21,332,000	100,113,231	23,796,745	76,316,486	190.20	5
Minneapolis	380,582	19,775,606	15,806,500	1,930,000	.....	37,512,106	3,012,434	34,499,672	90.65	21
Kansas City, Missouri[9]	324,410	8,031,000	10,791,000	2,861,000	.....	21,683,000	6,169,785	15,513,215	47.82	31
Seattle[10]	315,652	15,626,400	9,592,000	29,926,100	.....	55,144,500	572,058	54,572,442	172.89	6
Indianapolis	314,194	9,851,100	8,413,750	.....	.....	18,264,850	1,033,262	17,231,588	54.84	28
Rochester	295,750	9,844,000	8,055,020	10,817,000	.....	28,716,020	3,032,917	25,683,103	86.84	24
Portland[11]	258,288	7,275,500	328,500	8,788,000	11,854,200	28,246,200	2,855,148	25,391,052	98.30	17
Denver	256,369	260,000	8,500,000	14,023,600	.....	22,783,600	136,596	22,647,004	88.33	23
Toledo	243,109	18,846,969	10,561,000	2,125,000	.....	31,532,969	5,713,660	25,819,309	106.20	15
Providence	237,595	16,213,000	4,447,000	8,132,000	.....	28,792,000	13,305,510	15,486,490	65.18	27
Columbus	237,031	17,245,316	7,505,000	7,716,500	.....	32,466,816	9,257,493	23,209,323	97.91	18
Louisville	234,891	10,995,500	1,966,400	1,079,000	.....	14,040,900	2,080,975	11,959,925	50.92	30
St. Paul	234,595	10,628,000	4,001,000	3,407,000	.....	18,036,000	1,535,379	16,500,621	70.34	26
Akron	208,435	8,326,678	6,104,748	10,200,000	.....	24,631,426	2,087,039	22,544,387	108.16	13
Atlanta	200,616	4,217,000	1,860,000	1,917,000	.....	7,994,000	2,032,584	5,761,416	28.71	33
Dayton	153,830	7,238,280	3,985,000	2,064,000	.....	13,287,280	2,160,296	11,126,984	72.33	25
Grand Rapids	137,634	2,146,600	2,284,100	2,096,000	.....	6,526,700	2,623,414	3,903,286	28.36	34
Des Moines	126,468	5,977,859	4,217,700	4,175,000	.....	14,370,559	82,975	14,287,584	112.97	10
Norfolk	115,772	11,927,269	3,115,235	12,151,496	.....	27,194,000	3,273,070	23,920,930	206.60	3
Duluth	98,917	2,775,000	2,822,000	3,526,000	.....	9,123,000	343,310	8,779,690	88.75	22
Toronto, Canada	529,083	58,352,601	22,276,715	64,458,263	.....	145,087,579	30,031,848	115,055,731	217.46	1
Montreal[12]	618,506	119,328,069	23,389,052	.....	.....	142,717,121	13,645,912	129,071,209	208.36	2

NOTE: The cities are arranged in order of population, except Toronto and Montreal. Los Angeles, New Orleans, Jersey City and Oakland were omitted because the data were not furnished.

[1] New York: Debt by classes not available; total includes boroughs and that portion of debt of the counties imposed upon the city in 1898. Deducting bonds exempt from the debt limit, the gross debt was $1,383,954,811.

[2] Chicago: Does not include county or forest preserve district (county) bonds of $24,662,500.

[3] Philadelphia: Includes city and county of Philadelphia; general bonds include all bonds issued for work for which special assessments are levied.

[4] Detroit: Debt as of January 31, 1923. Utility bonds include street railway, which has also contractual notes of purchase of $17,080,000.

[5] Cleveland: School debt as of August 31, 1922.

[6] Boston: Includes debt of county of Suffolk, $1,852,500; Miscellaneous bonds: rapid transit and subway, $39,123,700.

[7] Baltimore: Miscellaneous bonds: electrical conduit, $6,209,740; wharves and docks, $6,185,000; aid to Western Maryland Railroad, $4,263,000.

[8] Cincinnati: Miscellaneous bonds: Cincinnati Southern Railway construction and terminal bonds, $21,332,000.

[9] Kansas City: City debt as of April 17, 1922; school debt as of June 30, 1922.

[10] Seattle: Public utility bonds are not obligations of the city, and principal and interest are payable solely from the revenues.

[11] Portland: Debt as of November 30, 1922. Miscellaneous bonds: port and dock, $11,854,200.

[12] Montreal: Bonded debt as of January 1, 1922; school debt as of June 30, 1921. General bonds include public utility bonds. Schools are under separate control and the municipality is not legally responsible for the school debt.

STATE SUPERVISION OF MUNICIPAL ACCOUNTS[1]

BY WYLIE KILPATRICK
National Institute of Public Administration

"H. Bell" was the unchallenged entry on the payroll of a New Jersey city for four years. And for that length of time a horse—presumably a person surnamed "Bell"—was regularly carried as a salaried employee while the monthly wages were pocketed by a foreman who obligingly signed "H. Bell" on the payroll as a convenience to "one of his gang."

Defalcation and peculation by municipal officers, some no less humorous, have formed the more spectacular reason for state supervision of municipal accounts. Following the enactment of the Indiana accounting law of 1909 it was discovered that in a certain county several officials used rooms in the court house in which to gamble, and when their own funds ran short they issued county warrants in payment of fictitious claims. The pot in one instance must have broken wrong for a player, for one officer filed claims for $425 for fountain pens!

How narrowly the charge of defalcation should be modified by qualifying adjectives or how strongly it should be emphasized is a subject largely covered by a smoke-screen of muddled accounting, court room gossip, and unverified muck-raking. It is well to remember, however, that when the first thorough investigation of municipal accounts is made by a state bureau, numerous embezzlements are almost invariably discovered. During the first year of state inspection in Indiana, $186,044 was recovered of funds improperly diverted from the public treasury. Over $6,000,000 has been recovered in Ohio since the establishment of the state bureau of accounts.

Whatever the extent of financial lawlessness by municipal officials, past or present, their proven dishonesty in certain instances has aroused a public attention to the need for more exact accounting methods and the fixing of responsibility for auditing upon a centralized agency. Spectacular lawlessness—even though it be isolated—has done more to hasten the enactment of state accounting laws than more reasoned briefs of financial policy.

LEGISLATION WITHOUT ADMINISTRATIVE SUPERVISION

The original method of exercising state control over municipal finance was the characteristic solution resorted to by many reformers, the setting up of statutory or constitutional prohibitions against badness on the part of the officers without the use of administrative supervision. The effect of these inhibitions is now recognized. A wilful disobedience at the worst, or a haphazard obedience at the best, followed the passage of state laws governing the accountability of local officers in their financial transactions. When

[1] This article was written as a part of the author's work as a student in the National Institute of Public Administration. The legal provisions forming the basis of discussion have been compiled in tabular form. A number of typewritten copies of this table have been prepared by the New York Bureau of Municipal Research and will be furnished at cost to those interested.

no method of law enforcement or administration was provided, inevitably the observance of the law was optional with municipal officers. Usage and routine in local offices or the precedent of previous officers offered handy alibis to officers who for reasons of their own may have preferred to overlook state laws. The continuous disregard of statutory provisions may, in fact, indicate no wilful disobedience, for the municipal officer may be in the anomalous, though not surprising, position of being unacquainted with state laws expressly designed to govern his duties. If the legal provisions are complex, if no attempt is made to outline and interpret their requirements to him, or if the current session laws are not even available to him, the municipal officer will administer local finance in innocent disregard of contrary laws.

However futile may be laws whose observance is optional in practice, the basic reason prompting state supervision is found to a larger degree in another condition. Can the responsibility of planning a scientific accounting system and establishing a procedure for its operation be placed upon local officers? A vast body of experience proves that a technical duty of this nature requires expert assistance which can be most conveniently provided by a state bureau. A municipal officer, usually elected for a short term and receiving a low salary, seldom has the training which fits him to devise an accounting system. Less frequently has he the time to inaugurate acceptable methods during his short tenure in office. If the standards of procedure are the haphazard precedents of a sundry collection of officeholders who preceded him, the administration of the local officer can hardly be expected to measure up to the requirements of scientific accounting.

SELF-INTEREST DRIVES STATES TOWARD SUPERVISION

Irrespective of any theory as to the desirability of supervising municipal finance, the state finds itself adopting the methods of supervisory control in order to safeguard its own interests. A part, and usually no small part, of the state's revenues are collected by local officers and transferred from city or county treasuries to the state. Dishonest or lax methods by municipalities may be the direct cause of misappropriation or diversion of funds from the state treasury. Equally serious is the indirect effect upon the financial standing of all communities resulting from lawlessness in any one city. The gutting of a town treasury must react adversely upon the credit of neighboring cities. Investors cannot view municipal bonds without suspicion when fraudulent practices are unearthed in even one city of the state.

SUPERVISION STIMULATED BY REPORT OF NATIONAL MUNICIPAL LEAGUE

Wyoming by provision of its state constitution created the office of state examiner in 1890, the year of her admission into the Union. The legislative act of that year defining the duties of the examiner was the first law placed on the statute books of any state providing for adequate state supervision of local accounts.

A number of laws prior to this date pointed the way for the more comprehensive statutes which were passed in following years. Supervisory power over county officers was given the Indiana state auditor in 1852. Inspection of county officers again found expression in law through a Minnesota statute in 1878. Wyoming was the first state to provide for uniform municipal accounting by the law of 1890. Sentiment for adequate state super-

vision was crystallized in a report before the National Municipal League convention in 1898. Three phases of supervision were recommended: prescribing and installing uniform accounting for municipalities, collecting and publishing comparative statistics, and making inspections of local accounting offices. These three aspects of the proposal have continued to be the cardinal principles around which legislation has been framed in the last twenty-five years.

In a halting manner various states have felt their way towards enacting the program outlined before the National Municipal League. The process in many states has hardly been conscious, the first steps often being taken without recognition that they would lead to complete supervision. Massachusetts is a state in instance. In 1869 the Massachusetts bureau of statistics of labor was started, a bureau with no duties relating to local government. A division of manufacturers was added, and finally, in 1906, the collection of municipal statistics was made a duty of the bureau of statistics.

The broadening of bank examination to include auditing of municipal accounting has been a development in several states. The duties of the public examiner of South Dakota, dating from 1887, included the auditing of banks as well as of state institutions. By 1911, the work of examining banks took the time of the examiner to such a degree that a separate officer, the executive accountant, was created to supervise public accounts, including state institutions. Minnesota illustrates a curious manner of growth of the movement. The 1878 act, previously mentioned, established a public examiner to examine banking institutions as well as state and county offices. The examiner was given partial jurisdiction in 1891 over the accounts of St. Paul, this power being extended to Minneapolis fourteen years later. Not until 1913 was his jurisdiction extended completely over the municipalities of the state.

The collection of taxes has been another angle from which a beginning towards supervision was made. The Wisconsin legislature directed the tax commission to inquire into the methods of municipal accounting and only following this investigation was the 1911 law enacted providing for partial state supervision. A frequent approach to the question has been by state inspection of city or county offices handling state funds. Three states to-day limit the scope of their inspection of local accounts to county officers concerned with state finances, Alabama, Kentucky, and Maryland. A much larger number, seventeen, provide for the inspection of county as well as city or town finances.[1]

After the passage of the Wyoming law, twelve years elapsed before adequate methods of supervisory control found legal expression. Ohio in 1902 established the state bureau of inspection and supervision of public offices. The Ohio bureau in the two following decades continued to be the model after which many laws were patterned. Important enactments followed in more rapid succession. State examiners of public accounts or bureaus of municipal accounts were provided in New York in 1905, Massachusetts and Iowa in 1906, Minnesota in 1907, and Indiana in 1909. Nearly every succeeding biennium has witnessed the passage of one or more state laws. The legislatures of New Jersey, New Hampshire, and New Mexico in 1921 made revisions of their accounting

[1] Indiana, Louisiana, Minnesota, Mississippi, Montana, New Hampshire, New Mexico, New York, North Dakota, Ohio, South Dakota, Virginia, Washington, West Virginia, Wisconsin.

methods which are among the latest laws extending the scope of state supervision.

The extent of adequate state audit of its own accounts and offices, while not specifically relating to local finance, shows the degree to which supervisory control is being recognized as an accepted principle. Thirty-nine states make provision for some form of audit of state offices by the bureau which examines local accounts. Of this number, twenty-one make mandatory an audit yearly or oftener. Installation of an accounting system, uniform for offices of the same grade, is required in thirty-three states. A smaller number, twenty-five, enable the supervisory bureau to keep in close touch with fiscal operations of the state through periodic reports submitted by state officers and institutions.

It is significant that of all the states in the Union, only one—Rhode Island—has no legal requirement for some form of supervision of accounting, state or municipal, by a centralized agency of the state. The law in many instances may be inadequate. Its administration may be faulty. But the presence of provisions on the statutes of forty-seven states leaves no doubt that supervisory control is to-day a recognized part of state administration.

FINANCIAL REPORTING

The value of the Massachusetts experience in collecting comparative municipal statistics has resulted in numerous legislative provisions patterned on the procedure of the Bay State. Fifteen states[2] require municipalities to make annually a financial report to the state, nearly all of whom provide for the publication of the reports in comparative tables. A second series of sixteen states[3] require some form of local reporting of finance, the requirement usually being confined to county officials or to those handling state funds.

The scope of the state publication is illustrated by the analysis printed by the New York state comptroller which contains:

1. Summary of financial transactions (classification of receipts, payments, and balances).
2. Analysis of income according to the nature of receipts and revenues.
3. Summary of payments classified by function performed.
4. Outstanding indebtedness and interest charges analyzed as to character of the obligation.

These four elements are normally found in every state publication of municipal statistics, although supplementary statements are always added by individual bureaus. The receipts and outlays for municipal industries and the valuation of property are important tables in several reports. The mass of undigested statistics, which the report may readily become, has been interpreted in a readable fashion by several bureaus, notably those of Ohio, New York, and Massachusetts. Charts are printed in their reports, showing graphically the increase or decrease in the cost of various functions as well as graphical representations of revenues and payments.

The better class of publications of municipal finance are now complete as reference volumes of financial information. The next step in their improvement, difficult though it may be, is to correlate physical with fiscal data. Of

[2] California, Indiana, Iowa, Massachusetts, Minnesota, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, Ohio, Pennsylvania, South Carolina, Washington, West Virginia, Wisconsin.

[3] Colorado, Connecticut, Idaho, Kentucky, Louisiana, Michigan, Mississippi, Nevada, Oklahoma, Oregon, Tennessee, Texas, Vermont, Ohio, South Dakota, Washington.

what value is a comparison between the cost of education in two cities if we do not know the degree of service rendered, if the number of school children and teachers and salaries is not revealed. This illustration holds true for most of the municipal services, whether it is fire and police protection or the laying of sewer systems. The limitations of any governmental report of comparative statistics are well recognized. To the voter who wishes to judge the comparative performances of officers, statistics which are not interpreted over a common denominator are useless. If corresponding physical data, however, can be added to the fiscal statistics at present contained in the publications, the voter will be given a guage to measure municipal services and officers. The utility of the publication will be multiplied when a municipal officer of any nature, whether street or public work, can turn to it for comparative information expressed in concrete terms of cost and service.

UNIFORM ACCOUNTING

Following the first state law requiring uniform municipal accounting, that of Wyoming in 1890, twelve other states[4] have made mandatory the requirement for the installation of uniform methods in local accounting offices. Sixteen other states have legal provisions for an accounting system, six[5] of whom limit the requirement for uniformity to county offices. By request of the locality or recommendation of the supervising bureau, an accounting procedure will be installed in a local office in seven states[6] while in the remaining three states,[7] whose statutes deal with the subject, uniform accounting applies only to county offices handling state funds.

Uniform accounting is "*merely the enforcing of adequate standards of performance.*" The state must take notice of the methods of a particular office because its laws set standards of conduct which are inoperative under faulty accounting. That the procedure is uniform is the natural result of determining what standard is desirable. The drawing of comparative statistics between municipalities would be hindered, if not made impossible, without uniformity in the primary accounts. Uniformity is required, of course, only as between officers of the same class and function.

The actual administration of accounting installations has encountered obstacles when the attempt was made to impose hastily a complete system throughout the state. In Iowa the state auditor declared after an attempt "to install a system offhand that it was necessary to abandon the original plan and build anew as experience pointed the way." The procedure followed by Wisconsin, devised to avoid administrative friction, provides for:

1. Municipalities desiring to adopt the system are required to make formal application guaranteeing to pay the (installation) costs.

2. Preliminary surveys are then made of the conditions to be met in order to devise the system.

3. A system of double-entry bookkeeping is provided, designed to secure:

(a) A complete record of all municipal transactions on an accrual basis.

(b) To centralize the records of municipal activities in the clerk's office.

[4] California, Indiana, Iowa, Minnesota, Montana, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New York, North Dakota, Ohio, South Dakota, Washington.

[5] Colorado, Georgia, Idaho, Michigan, Missouri, New Mexico.

[6] Louisiana, Massachusetts, Nevada, Pennsylvania, Virginia, Vermont, Wisconsin.

[7] Kansas, Kentucky, Maryland.

(c) Continuous audit of all financial transactions by some responsible local official.

(d) Methods of accounting adapted to the capacity of non-experts and changing officials.

(e) Uniformity enough to produce comparable results and at the same time elasticity to meet varying conditions.

(f) Information of municipal activities by reports to the state commission.

(g) A budget system to furnish the public with information regarding expenditures.

4. In installing these systems all officials concerned are carefully instructed how to keep them. Usually a period of from two to ten months of the financial history of each municipality is rewritten under the new system which serves as a guide for future transactions.

5. Subsequent inspections are provided so that each system may be inspected to determine whether the records are properly kept."[8]

EXAMINATION AND AUDIT

The maintenance of financial standards as outlined in state laws and detailed in accounting procedure cannot be entrusted to an automatic self-working. As a necessary corollary to setting up of the machinery is its operation by corps of inspectors of the state supervisory office. Field inspectors who travel from office to office examine municipal accounts, preferably once a year.

The need for an independent audit of municipal accounts by an outside agency is recognized in the laws of thirty-six states. Adequate provision for a compulsory examination once a year is required by the statutes of fourteen states.[9] In five states the requirement is optional and may be met when the state agency deems desirable or the locality requests an audit.[10] An occasional examination, or one confined to county offices, is the scope of the audit in sixteen states.[11] Mississippi is distinctive in using the revenue agent plan under which the agents are given *carte blanche* authority to unearth any peculations by local officers that they may find—and get a "slice" of the recovered money.

A very inadequate method of checking local finance has been resorted to by a few states in requiring the submission of detailed reports to the state agency. The checking up of these reports may or may not reveal the true condition of the municipality, depending upon the accuracy and honesty of the reporting officers.

ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATION

A variety of organization is provided by the state statutes shading off from an elaborate staff organization solely concerned with municipal finance to the appointment of a special investigator by the governor. Frequently, the state administrating bureaus are in the department of the auditor of the state.[12] Equally prevalent has been the practice of creating an independent agency variously named "public examiner," "executive accountant," or "state accountant."[13] The chief of this agency is responsible directly to the governor or to a state board of examiners.

[8] Report of the Wisconsin Tax Commission, 1916.

[9] Indiana, Iowa, Minnesota, Montana, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, North Dakota, Ohio, South Dakota, Virginia, Washington, and West Virginia.

[10] California, Louisiana, Massachusetts, Wisconsin, and Wyoming.

[11] Alabama, Arkansas, Colorado, Delaware, Georgia, Idaho, Kansas, Kentucky, Maryland, Michigan, Missouri, Nevada, Oklahoma, Florida, Tennessee, Vermont.

[12] Arizona, Colorado, Connecticut, Iowa, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Missouri, Nevada, New York, New Mexico, North Carolina, Ohio, and Vermont.

[13] Alabama, Delaware, Indiana, Kansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Minnesota, Montana, New Jersey, North Dakota, Oklahoma, South Dakota, Texas, Virginia, Wyoming.

In two states, Wisconsin and West Virginia, the supervising agency is under the state tax commission, which has partial jurisdiction also in Oregon and South Carolina. In those states in which the state government has recently been reorganized, the bureau has been placed in the department of finance. California, Idaho, Illinois, Nebraska, and Utah have found that the logical place for the agency is in that department.

A surprising confusion exists in several states by distributing authority among more than one agency. Three states, Connecticut, Oregon and South Carolina, have seen fit to allow separate officers to exercise supervision while Mississippi occupies the unhonored position of having a three-headed control. In that state localities report the condition of their finances to the state auditor, the revenue agents investigate accounts, and as an extra-precaution the governor may appoint special accountants, perhaps to check up the revenue agents as well as the municipalities.

The New Jersey system, unique to that state, deserves mention. The field work of the department of accounts is not done by regular state employees, for the department maintains a list of municipal accountants who, upon registration, are empowered to audit local accounts. The municipalities, under mandate of being examined at stated intervals, hire a registered accountant whose certified report is submitted to the state department.

CLEARING HOUSE FOR INFORMATION

The greatest rpomise for future usefulness of the state supervising bureau hardly consists in the formal accounting procedure devised or in local audits made. Possibly in the use of the state office as a clearing house to which municipalities naturally turn for advice and information, the existence of the bureau finds its best justification. The advisory function of the bureau grows as the staff gradually builds up confidence in its work among the municipalities. The volume of daily mail containing inquiries about current problems of finance, the conversations held in the bureau's office, and the aid which the staff gives while inspecting local offices, form a rough index as to how far the bureau has "dug in."

In no field can the bureau be of more use as an advisor than in law. To the local officer it can outline the requirements of the latest session laws. To the state legislature it can submit constructive measures of reform based on the data it has collected within the state and close observation of the operation of experimental laws elsewhere.

The advisory function of the bureau provides it with the needed opportunity to correlate the three-fold aspect of its work—installation of uniform accounting systems in municipal offices, examination of local accounts, and the compilation of comparative municipal statistics. A bureau having the confidence of municipal officers throughout the state may extend the standard accounting methods with their ready acquiescence or upon their invitation. Audit of municipal accounts by a state inspector is not resented when the local officers are accustomed to view the bureau as a partner in working out fiscal problems. If the municipal officers look to state publications of statistics as a guide, coercive measures need not be used to compel the submission of the detailed reports required by law.

The trend towards complete adoption of supervisory control of municipal finance by the state has been so gradual that it has escaped the attention

which more spectacular changes attract. To paraphrase Blackstone's dictum on the growth of English common law: state supervisory control has been secreted from the intestines of financial administration. The methods by which it now seeks to function are but the natural aftermath of the state's duty to protect the integrity and credit of public finance within its boundaries; they have been and will be extended piecemeal as the circumstances in each state prove the need for their adoption.

ITEMS ON MUNICIPAL ENGINEERING

EDITED BY WILLIAM A. BASSETT

Enforced Curtailment of Essential Municipal Activities.—Drastic curtailment during the present year of essential public service appears to be the only alternative facing many Ohio cities as a result of the operation of the obsolete and restrictive tax laws of that state. Obviously, some cities are more seriously affected than others at this time, but the situation confronting Cincinnati is a particularly desperate one.

In the latter city at the election held in the fall of 1922 a proposed special tax levy designed to provide funds urgently necessary for the carrying on of the city government and the support of the public schools was defeated by the voters, although the administration making the request was continued in power. As a result of the defeat of this measure, the city government and the schools for the next two years will be short of funds required for the efficient functioning of government by an amount estimated at not less than two million dollars. The city administration has faced the situation by authorizing extensive reductions in practically all departments. These call for a curtailment in the police and fire protection service furnished and a cessation of street repair work and the collection of ashes and rubbish. Similar action has been or is to be taken by other Ohio cities in order to meet their local problems. It will be interesting to see just what will be the effect on the public of a curtailment in the services which it has been demanding and receiving in many of these branches closely related to public comfort and convenience. Naturally, any reduction due alone to shortage of funds in police and fire protection service tends to increase hazards to the safety of the community in a way that is not pleasant to contemplate. These phases of the situation alone are of sufficient importance to demand the most serious consideration of public officials and of citizens, but there is one other element that is of the gravest importance from the point of view of sound financial policy which has not received the recognition that it should. This is the practice followed in the past by many Ohio cities of financing street repair, maintenance and repaving out of bond issues. Reliable information as to the amounts expended in this way by various municipalities is not available, but a casual inquiry into this matter covering three cities alone disclosed that up to 1921 there were $3,350,000 of street bonds outstanding.

Undoubtedly one of the first places in which Ohio cities will seek to economize will be on their street work, both construction and maintenance. In the matter of maintenance, this means that if funds are not provided to carry on such work from year to year, progressive deterioration of pavements will result and the expenditure, within a few years for reconstruction, required to provide for traffic needs, will be far in excess of the amount needed each year to protect against such an occurrence.

In order to provide for financing the sewage disposal projects and the collection and disposal of garbage, which are closely related to public health, a bill sponsored by the Ohio state department of health has recently been introduced in the legislature of that state authorizing the cities and villages of Ohio to make annual charges for the use of sewerage systems which will be sufficient to take care of capital charges, maintenance and operating expenses of such systems. Under conditions now prevailing in many Ohio municipalities, it may be that something of this sort is desirable as regards both the sewerage facilities and the collection and disposal of garbage. It should, however, be recognized that both of these services are distinctly community benefits and should be financed on that basis.

Any devices of this kind are palliative in character. They do not get at the root of the evil. The situation confronting Ohio cities constitutes a state problem. To meet it there should be a thorough and sane revision of the tax laws of Ohio. That this has not been done long before is a cynical commentary on the collective intelligence of the citizens of that commonwealth.

*

What Constitutes the Best Type of Pavement.—The imperative necessity of competent engineering judgment in the determination of the type of pavement suitable to meet any particular

set of conditions has been long recognized by those familiar with problems of highway administration, but it is amazing what scant appreciation many public officials have of the importance of this matter and also how uninformed the public is with respect to its significance. Two ways in which the latter conditions are manifest are, first, the practice followed by many communities of permitting the owners of property abutting any contemplated street improvement to select the type of pavement to be used, and second, the impression that apparently exists in the minds of many intelligent people either that there is or can be developed some type of pavement universally suitable to meet all conditions of traffic. The former constitutes by far the more serious problem. It has resulted probably in more ill-advised street construction than is due to any other cause. Its continuance should not be permitted in any community and it is encouraging to note that there is to-day a trend away from this practice.

With respect to what may be termed the quest for the universally supreme type of road there is likewise need for public education, and the following editorial comment on this subject, appearing in a recent issue of the *Engineering News-Record*, is of timely interest:

"Last week at Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, at the conference of highway officials called by Governor Pinchot, evidence of the quest appeared repeatedly in the questions raised for answer. It is difficult for the heads of government not trained as engineers to avoid the notion that there is somewhere to be found a universally best road and that it will be disclosed if road officials will go into conference and talk enough about the subject. At the Harrisburg conference it proved easy as usual to raise a dispute between partisans of different types of roads, and as usual this dispute arrived nowhere. The useful effort of the conference was the determination with which the engineer delegates drove home the truth that the selection of road type and its design are widely different problems in different sections of the country and that knowledge of traffic and its probable trend is essential to intelligent selection and design. There is no universally best road surface any more than there is a best type of bridge or a best size of shoes." As pointed out by the editor, "if this fact can be established in the minds of public officials it will pay to hold many conferences like that called by the Governor of Pennsylvania even though they develop no thought with which the road expert is not familiar."

*

Political Road Control.—New Jersey with $20,000,000 to spend on roads this year has made the administration of its highway department an issue of partisan politics. Incidentally the state since January 22 has been without a responsible head of its road-building activities. These facts possess a disquieting significance not confined to the effect on highway development in the single state directly concerned. They exemplify a reversion of thought on public roads work which is being manifested in many states and which if not checked may undo much that has been accomplished in the last few years toward putting state highway administration on a fairly high plane. They point to the necessity of organized corrective effort akin to that which created the demand of the last few years for road improvement.

Considering the New Jersey situation specifically, there will be few mourners for the old, eight-man, bipartisan highway commission. The smaller commission of four, provided by the new law, although it is still bipartisan, is a much preferable working organization. One may commend also the personnel of the new commission as it has been named for confirmation. There is no great cause to criticize any of the minor provisions of the new law and some of them can be praised. All this granted, the fact remains outstanding that the law is purely the creation of partisan politics. Not one provision, from the bipartisan requirement to the number of commissioners and the appointive power, was decided on any basis except compromise between a democratic governor and a republican legislature.

The calm assumption by the executive and the legislature of the right to discuss and arrange the highway business of New Jersey as a political issue and the complacent acceptance by the public of this assumption, constitutes to-day the hazard to highway development which thoughtful engineers most fear. The condition is not peculiar to New Jersey; it exists in a number of other states where, however, it is not quite so bold in displaying itself naked to the world.

The discouraging truth is that all over the country a determined effort is being made to swing the great work of road-building into the list of public activities which proceed under political favor. Power has been lent to those

who seek this goal by an economic condition which has set the people astir to ease their burden of high taxes and high costs. Watching their highway bills pile up to hundreds of millions a year, taxpayers are in a fit temper to follow the leader who promises relief by calling back the old régime of local direction and control. Such leaders are not lacking and they are getting followers in exactly the degree that the people have not been educated in the highway business.

Following a period of active education of the public to the need of good roads there has been a period of no schooling. Rampant propagandists as they were in large part, the old "good roads" organizations accomplished their object of creating an active public sentiment for improved highways. With the first lesson taught education ceased. Federal and state highway departments and associations of road builders have taken up educational work only as it has concerned the technique of highway building and operation. Their work has been remarkable but, with rare exceptions, they have done little to teach the people generally the business of highway engineering and highway transport. There is need for someone to perform this task.

The above comment appeared recently in the editorial columns of the *Engineering-News Record*. Although directed primarily towards the New Jersey situation, it so well epitomizes conditions which at present menace the efficient administration of highway matters in many of our states that it is desired to bring it to the attention of the readers of the Review.—Ed.

✠

Extensive Bond Issue for Public Improvements Authorized by Voters of St. Louis, Missouri.—A program of municipal improvements representing a contemplated expenditure of $87,372,500 was authorized by the voters of St. Louis at an election held February 7, 1923. According to the *Engineering-News Record* of February 22, this is the largest municipal bond issue authorized by popular vote by any American city. The improvement program put up to the people comprised twenty-one items of which all but one received the necessary two-thirds vote. These items among others made provision for additional water supply facilities, hospital construction, extensions to the sewer system, increased facilities for the fire department, program of grade crossing elimination, and the construction of a municipal auditorium, a municipal plaza and hall.

The approval of this improvement program represents the culmination of intelligent co-operation and effort both on the part of the city officials and various civic organizations in bringing to the attention of the public of St. Louis the significance and value of the work planned.

An interesting feature of the election was that less than one-third of those entitled to vote on the project did so. At the same time the results would indicate that the program of municipal improvements submitted when explained to the public had met with popular approval.

Other cities have not been so fortunate in presenting their cases to the public. The situation in Cincinnati brought about by the defeat at the recent election of the special tax levy, a levy designed to supply money urgently needed for the carrying on of the city government and the support of the public schools, is an example of a different character. A similar case has been noted in the experience of Cape Town, Africa, where the municipality had an election to approve a plan for much needed street and sewer improvements involving an expenditure of about one million dollars. The election resulted in 805 votes for the project and 2,785 against.

A few years ago a bond issue designed to provide funds for a much needed extension to the existing sewer system of a large western city was voted down. Subsequently that city had to resort to emergency measures in order to provide in part for the improvement for which these funds were designed and at the same time was seriously involved in damage suits arising from the overloading of the existing sewer system.

That experience would indicate that though the voice of the people may be the voice of God, it is not always the voice of progress. Both the city officials and the public of St. Louis are to be congratulated on their recent action. There is, however, ample opportunity for energetic educational work in other communities in this country for the purpose of keeping the public not only aware of the needs of the community but also cognizant of the individual citizen's responsibility for meeting these needs.

✠

Caution Plates on Motor Trucks to Prevent Overloading.—Equipping all motor trucks with caution plates on which would be stamped information relating to the permissible loading is proposed by manufacturers as a means for effect-

ing control over the overloading of such equipment. According to Mr. David C. Fenner, Manager, Public Works Department, International Motor Company, such plates would show the maximum gross load for the front axle, the maximum allowable gross load for the rear axle, the maximum allowable speed and the distance in which the vehicle, loaded to capacity, can be stopped with each set of brakes operated independently, with the vehicle running at the above maximum speed on a hard, dry level roadway.

This information would give the owner the data required for painting weight and carrying capacity on the sides of the vehicle to comply with the local state law. By making this information a prerequisite to the issuance of a truck license it would prevent the operation of unsuitable trucks and enforce the proper operation of good trucks. Moreover, such a provision would place the penalty for poorly adjusted brakes and steering connections directly on the operator, where it belongs.

It is gratifying to note that the motor vehicle industry is lending its weight and its influence to preventing both overloading and over-speeding of motor truck equipment. As an aid in reducing the hazard on the public highway as well as its value in preventing the destruction of road sections from overloading, the above suggestion deserves careful consideration by all those formulating legislation dealing with the problem of motor vehicle regulation.

Lighting of Public Highways an Important Factor in Accident Prevention.—The important relationship that lighting systems of public highways bear to the protection of traffic using these highways and the need for a systematic program of education directed towards securing better service in this matter are emphasized by Mr. David Beecroft, Vice-President of the North Atlantic Division of the National Highway Traffic Association.

According to Mr. Beecroft an analysis of accidents on public highways during 1922 in the state of Connecticut disclosed the fact that a very considerable number of such occurrences were directly traceable to defective lighting either of the highway or motor vehicle, or both. In general it may be stated that motor cars are too often overlighted and motor trucks generally underlighted. Probably the last criticism applies most generally to the highway itself. It is only comparatively recently that attention has been given to what constitute the requirements of lighting public highways outside of cities, and hence there is not much precedent in this matter. However, the experience gained in the use of signal lights at street intersections in suburban areas is of distinct value. During the past year there has been rapid development in the installation of such facilities. There has, however, been practically no regulation as to type of signals employed with the result that there has been considerable variation and a general lack of uniformity. In one city of 40,000 population, adjacent to New York City, there are three different colored lights placed on an important highway within a distance of two miles. All three are blinking types of intermittent lights, one showing green light in both directions, another green in one direction and white in another, and another red in one direction and green in another. The undesirability of an arrangement of this kind cannot be overestimated. They impose a serious strain on the mental energy of the driver of the motor vehicle which would not be present if a steady green light were employed. The example cited is by no means an extreme one. Similar conditions obtain practically throughout the Metropolitan zone of New York City and also in many of the other large cities of the country. Unquestionably this lack of uniformity in signal lights adds materially to the hazard of night driving. All highway signal lights at intersections should be standardized as to color, height, and preferably location. The essential requirements governing these matters could well be included as a part of the state highway law.

BOOKS AND REPORTS

CHARACTER AND FUNCTIONING OF MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSIONS IN THE UNITED STATES. Report of the Committee on Civil Service of the Government Research Conference of the United States and Canada, 1922. Obtainable from W. H. Beyer, chairman, 805 Franklin Bank Building, Philadelphia.

The report of the Committee on Civil Service of the Government Research Conference is thought provoking and suggestive. It has character, is interestingly written and leaves the reader with a definite program. The recommendations of the report are based on a conviction that it is becoming more and more necessary to have a truly positive and better outlined employment policy for public service—a policy in keeping with the best in present-day employment management. The committee believes that in civil service administration there must be a "change of emphasis from the prevention of spoils to the promotion of morale and efficiency." As the key factor in the effective carrying out of this more comprehensive and dynamic program, the makeup of the commission itself is subjected to a rather searching but constructive criticism.

Two groups of standards are advanced by the committee "in an effort to appraise our civil service commissions." The first group is made up of "those which may be fairly applied to civil service commissions in the past." Commissions should be non-political in character, faithfully enforce merit principles, and maintain continuity of employment policy. The committee finds that the application of this first group of standards shows certain weaknesses that ought to be corrected. It believes that "to a large extent civil service commissions themselves have been made footballs of politics."

The second and additional group of standards is one "to which civil service commissions have not always been expected to conform in the past but to which they will have to conform more and more in the future."

"a. Civil service commissions should be under professional guidance.

"b. Civil service commissions should perform adequately all employment functions of government.

"c. Civil service commissions should make possible democratic administration of the employment affairs of government."

"With these standards in mind, the committee has endeavored to examine the character and functioning of municipal civil service commissions in the United States, to draw lessons from the experience of private concerns and of other countries in employment administration, and to suggest ways of improving our civil service administration, with particular reference to the makeup of the commissions themselves."

May civil service commissions as they are now constituted "be expected to measure up to the new tasks that will devolve upon them with the change of emphasis from the prevention of spoils to the promotion of morale and efficiency?" To this query, the committee answers "No." The commission which is proposed to measure up to the standards of both group one and two is to be composed of a civil service commissioner selected competitively on the basis of his technical and professional qualifications for employment and personnel work. He is to be the executive officer, but is to be assisted in judicial and legislative matters by two associate commissioners. One of these associates is to be from the chief executive's staff while the other is to be selected by the employes of the classified service.

Around these standards and suggestions centers a most interesting discussion. Especial attention is given to the new functions of employment and personnel management and to the advantages of employe representation. In the appendix are found tabulated replies to the questionnaire on which part of the report was based. Definite legal provisions are given for carrying out the recommendations of the report.

The report is bold and definite in its suggestions. It is a challenge to thought and action, and although some of its proposals will no doubt meet with spirited opposition, the soundness of its fundamental appeal will be generally recognized.

ALLEN M. RUGGLES.

THE FIRST YEAR OF THE BUDGET OF THE UNITED STATES. By Charles G. Dawes. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1922.

The book consists of the memorandum and notes, which were made by General Dawes during the progress of his work as director of the budget together with the official orders and statements issued in connection with the inauguration of our first national budget system.

An appendix, comprising 170 pages, gives in detail the estimated economies and savings in governmental business for the fiscal year 1922, resulting from the system of co-ordinating agencies created by executive order, on the recommendation of the director of the budget. These economies and savings total $250,134,835.

The results, accomplished in the first year's work of the budget bureau, strikingly illustrate the value and importance of impartial, impersonal, non-political, scientific research and investigation, in governmental affairs, coupled with a strong executive who will consistently exert pressure in the interest of economy and efficiency.

The bureau of the budget was a small organization consisting of the director and eight assistants. The total expenditures for the first year were $120,313, although an appropriation of $225,000 had been granted. The bureau had no administrative duties, but was simply a fact-finding agency, engaged in gathering and compiling information from the departments, as a basis for the formulation of executive plans and policies relating to the economical and efficient administration of government. Each of the forty-one departments and independent agencies of government appointed a budget representative, who was the authorized agent of the department in collecting budget facts and information and presenting them to the director of the budget.

The imposition of executive pressure to reduce expenditures and requests for appropriations to the lowest point, consistent with the efficient functioning of the department, coupled with intelligent scrutiny of departmental requests by the officers of the budget bureau, resulted in the saving of 250 million dollars during the fiscal year 1922 and the submission of a budget for 1923 which contemplates a reduction in expenditures of $2,032,285,962 under actual expenditures in 1921 and $289,547,772 below actual expenditures during 1922.

The second achievement of the budget bureau was the establishment of a number of co-ordinating agencies for the purpose of correlating the activities of the separate departments in certain matters of routine business. The plan adopted was similar to that employed by the American Expeditionary forces in France.

These co-ordinating boards or committees were composed of men selected from the existing organization, who were familiar with the particular activity being co-ordinated, and were created for the purpose of establishing a centralized control over the given activity. Co-ordinating machinery was first established over purchasing, surplus supply and printing.

On the federal purchasing board there was detailed the chief purchasing officer of each department, with a chief co-ordinator as chairman, named by the president. The chief co-ordinator had the right to impose co-ordinating orders and thus prevent raising prices on each other or ask one department to execute the purchase for itself and as agent for the others. Each independent department of government appointed a director of purchases who represented the department in all matters involving purchases. Similarly a federal liquidation board was created for co-ordinating the sale of the large surplus stock of the various departments.

A surveyor-general of real estate was established to have charge of the lease or rental of all premises occupied by all government departments.

A federal motor transport agent was created to have control over the assignment of motor vehicles to government departments.

A federal traffic board was established to secure co-ordination in the conduct of the traffic business of the government.

And a board of hospitalization was established to co-ordinate the activities of the veterans' bureau, surgeon-general, and public health surgeon-general of the army, surgeon-general of the navy, superintendent of prisons and National Home for Disabled Volunteer Soldiers.

A very good idea of the accomplishments can be obtained by reading the official report of the director found on pages 100 to 154, and an address of the director, pages 172 to 189, and the report on economies and savings, pages 199 to 212.

DON C. SOWERS.

THE NATIONAL PARK SERVICE, ITS HISTORY, ACTIVITIES AND ORGANIZATION. By Jenks Cameron. No. 11 of the Service Monographs of the United States Government issued by the Institute for Government Research. D. Appleton and Co., 1922.

An extremely valuable monograph on "The National Park Service," prepared by Jenks Cameron of the Institute for Government Research, is the eleventh of the series of monographs on the services of the United States Government. At the outset the aim of the Institute in presenting these monographs is to "produce documents that will be of direct value and assistance in the administration of public affairs." The studies "are wholly descriptive in character." They are the raw material which executives, legislators and the public may use in reaching conclusions and offering constructive suggestions.

The National Park Service, created by the act of August 25, 1916, was actually brought into existence by the deficiency appropriation of April 17, 1917, and so has not quite reached its sixth birthday. The group of pioneers who secured the passage of the bill setting aside the Yellowstone for the use and enjoyment of the people were responsible more than fifty years ago for the "National Park idea." The "idea" developed until there was a definite demand for national parks. Since the establishment of a government service charged with the administration of the national parks a "policy" has also begun to emerge from the practices in the various parks.

The Service publishes historic and scientific pamphlets; rules and regulations for the various parks; maps and manuals; panoramic views and reports and proceedings. The organization by which it produces these services for the public is accurately described, the laws relating to national parks are codified and an excellent bibliography of works dealing directly with the National Park Service is appended.

Altogether the monograph is an indispensable reference book on the National Park Service.

HARLEAN JAMES.

CHARLES JOSEPH BONAPARTE: HIS LIFE AND PUBLIC SERVICES. By Joseph Bucklin Bishop, New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1922.

We have in this volume an interesting account of one of the outstanding leaders of the past generation, a leader in every movement that had for its purpose the betterment of public conditions, the raising of the standards of public life, the establishment of decency, honesty and effectiveness in public affairs. A founder of the Maryland Civil Service Reform League, and of the National Civil Service Reform League in 1881 and of the National Municipal League in 1894, an official in all of them, he was in the forefront of every movement, city, state or national which aimed to improve political conditions. It was only natural that with his abilities and learning and fearlessness he should be called upon to help Theodore Roosevelt in his many fights and as a member of his cabinet, first as secretary of the navy and later as attorney-general. Mr. Bishop has told his story entertainingly, trained journalist that he is, but his emphasis has been placed on his personal side and his cabinet work and only briefly on what Mr. Bonaparte himself liked to call his "reform" work. There is scarcely a dozen references to his long and arduous work in connection with the two national organizations which he helped to found and with which he was identified throughout his life and which lay very near his heart.

Charles J. Bonaparte was easily one of the big factors in the great movement of the latter part of the nineteenth century and the beginning of the twentieth for the purification of American politics and he deserves high praise and credit at the hands of his biographer, and this he gets from Mr. Bishop although it is to be regretted that more has not been said about these activities which carried his influence beyond his native city, where he was always a power for righteousness and decency.

C. R. W.

THE PLANNING OF THE MODERN CITY. By Nelson P. Lewis and Harold M. Lewis. 2nd edition. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1923. With numerous plates and diagrams.

This is the second edition of a book published about six years ago. That a second edition has become necessary in so short a time is a tribute both to the development of the subject and the excellence of the book. There has been little change over the first volume except that the records of accomplishments have been brought down to date and more attention given to zoning and regional planning. The established position of the authors and the real utility of the volume will assure for the new edition a continuation of the success of the old.

H. W. D.

NOTES AND EVENTS

I. GOVERNMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

The Indiana Legislature has again adopted a resolution amending the state constitution to authorize a state income tax. It remains to be seen whether it will be accepted by the people.

✽

The Washington Legislature has passed a law requiring that all new and refunding bonds hereafter issued shall be in serial form. This is in line with the tendency in the northwest to require all units of government to pay more businesslike attention to their debt obligations.

✽

The City of Portland, Maine, has been granted a referendum on a new city charter. The election will be in September. Three charters will be presented; a city-manager charter, a charter drafted by the mayor's committee providing for an elected mayor and council, and the present charter. Whichever charter gets 50 per cent of the votes cast will be adopted.

✽

Governor Moore of Idaho has vetoed the direct primary bill passed by both houses of the legislature, and there has not been sufficient strength to pass it over his veto. The governor was opposed to the measure on account of the expense involved and because he believed that the issues at the primaries are determined by the personality of candidates rather than the principles for which they stand.

✽

Municipal Vacation Camp Pays.—Mayor Davie of Oakland, California, reports that the municipal recreation camp, established in the Sierra Mountains last year, provided over 5,000 residents of the city with a mountain vacation at a very reasonable cost. Revenues for last summer exceeded maintenance by nearly a thousand dollars. Additional improvements are being made to accommodate an increasing number this summer. Oakland has just completed a $60,000 municipal golf course.

✽

Idaho Again Denied I. and R.—Although Idaho has had an initiative and referendum provision in the state constitution since 1912, the legislature has never set up the necessary election machinery to carry out the purposes of the act. At the recent session another bill was introduced providing such machinery and though it passed the house it was buried in committee in the senate. Thus the people of Idaho will continue to be denied access to a scheme to which they have given their approval.

✽

An Early Manager City.—Lionel Weil of Goldsboro, North Carolina, has discovered that the first charter of that city, adopted in 1847, provided what was virtually a council-manager form of government. The executive was the "intendant of police" selected by the council of five members. In addition to police functions, the intendant had financial duties. For one thing, he made up the tax list and levied the assessments. By definition the intendant is one who has charge of administration.

✽

Toledo Struggles with Salary Revision.—The Toledo city council recently overturned the second report of the salary revision committee prepared over a period of six months in 30 meetings. This is the second report that the council has rejected this year. A new salary committee has been appointed to wrestle with this problem.

The proposed changes affected 44 classifications, decreasing 13 classifications and increasing 31, out of more than 400 classifications in the city's employ. The aggregate increase, deducting small reductions, was about $9,000 annually.

✽

Hylan Would Abandon Pay-As-You-Go.—A bill has been introduced into the New York legislature, with the backing of Mayor Hylan, to violate the pay-as-you-go policy in favor of the spend-as-you-please policy. Specifically, the measure empowers the city to issue $15,000,000 of long term bonds annually for five years. The bonds are to be used for hospital improvements, street improvements and other capital expenditures. They will, however, represent a departure from the pay-as-you-go policy to which New York is now committed and as such are opposed by the comptroller. Although the comptroller is also a Democrat, his long standing feud with the

mayor adds considerable to the gaiety of New York life.

✦

Boulder Charter Overcomes Bitter Attack.—The Boulder, Colorado, charter, which provides for the city-manager form of government with a council elected by proportional representation, was sustained in an election on April 10 by more than a 2 to 1 vote. Walter J. Millard was present during the last days of an extremely bitter campaign.

The election was on a long amendment to the city charter which would have abolished P. R. and have made the manager a mere flunky of the mayor. Indeed decision as to whether there should be a manager at all was left to the council. If no city manager was chosen the mayor was to have all the powers of the manager.

A more extended account of this curious, abortive amendment will appear in a later issue.

✦

New Jersey's Optional Manager Bill.—The New Jersey optional charter bill, passage of which was reported in the last REVIEW, is applicable to any city, town, village, borough, township or any municipality governed by boards of commissioners or improvement commissions within the state. It provides that 15 per cent of the number of persons in any municipality who voted at the last general election may petition for an election upon the adoption of the charter. If a majority of those voting at the election are in favor of the manager form and if the number of those voting in the affirmative is equal to 30 per cent of those voting at the last election the charter is adopted.

The law provides for a manager appointed by the municipal council. Members of the council are subject to recall.

The manager is the chief executive of the municipality with power to appoint and remove all department heads. The election for councilmen follows an elimination primary.

✦

Home Rule for New York Cities.—The municipal home rule amendment to the New York constitution has passed both houses of the legislature, although in slightly different form. It is expected to be submitted to the voters in November. For a time there was some doubt as to its constitutionality, due to the fact that between the time the proposal was first introduced and the time it can be finally submitted to the voters the language of the portion of the constitution to be amended has been changed through the ratification of another constitutional amendment. Doubts were, however, dissolved by discovering earlier precedence supporting the constitutionality of the procedure.

If the people approve the amendment the legislature will be able to vest in cities and villages extensive home rule powers, including the right to adopt and amend municipal charters.

✦

High-Grade Positions Filled by Civil Service Examinations.—The report of the civil service commission of Philadelphia for the year 1921 lists 37 positions, paying from $2,500 to $6,000 per year, filled by competitive examinations. These positions include a deputy chief of the highways bureau at $6,000 and one at $5,400, a chief in the public welfare department at $4,000 and a superintendent of the garbage reduction plant at $4,800. A more recent appointment to a high-grade position is that of Dr. J. G. Cummings as chief of the health bureau at $4,000 plus 5 per cent bonus. Dr. Cummings has served in various important public posts including the directorship of the bureau of communicable diseases, California state board of health, and as captain, major and lieutenant-colonel in the medical corps of the United States army. He was assistant health officer in Washington, D. C., when appointed. The board of examiners conducting the examination under which he was appointed was composed of two prominent Philadelphia physicians and the secretary of the commission, Charles S. Shaughnessy. The League's honorary secretary, Clinton Rogers Woodruff, is president of the Philadelphia Civil Service Commission.

✦

Chicago City Club Proposes Metropolitan Plan for City and Environs.—In March a meeting of the Chicago City Club, attended by representatives from the municipalities and civic and commercial organizations interested, was held to confer upon the subject of a metropolitan plan. As a preliminary to the conference the City Club had prepared a report demonstrating the need for a regional survey. This report points out that the metropolitan district of Chicago has been one of the most rapidly growing urban areas in the entire country. For the past fifty years the territory has added each decade more than 500,000 to its population. The increase in the number and population of the politically independent suburbs has been more rapid in propor-

tion than in the city itself. This rapid concentration has produced many serious community problems which can be met only when the metropolitan territory is considered as a unit.

Within this metropolitan district there are more than 340 local government units spending taxes. There are more than 98 boards or engineers planning and constructing sewers; no less than 119 departments laying out and paving streets, and no less than 94 legislative bodies enacting ordinances and regulating local transportation. Building and sanitary regulations vary in the different units. Fire protection stops with the limits of several municipal corporations. Sewers are planned to meet the needs of the particular areas which pay for them. New streets and subdivisions are planned without regard to their future relation to the territory as a whole.

The conference, attended by more than 200 delegates, passed resolutions calling for the appointment of a committee of twenty-one to recommend a method by which planning for the entire metropolitan area may be successfully undertaken.

✠

Dubuque Enemies of Manager Government Active.—City-manager government in Dubuque, and particularly Manager O. E. Carr, have received a notable vote of confidence from the Dubuque Trades and Labor Congress in connection with a bill which has passed one house of the legislature reducing the interval from six to three years between possible elections over the change of the form of government of that city. The resolution of the Congress recites that it was an active force for the adoption of the manager plan in Dubuque in 1920 and that results have abundantly justified it. Under the new plan the city has proceeded with the retirement of old debt, has collected about $300,000 in delinquent taxes, has developed perhaps the best fire department in the state with a consequent reduction of insurance premiums in prospect, and has increased police court fines from $1,300 to $13,000.

The bill before the legislature is in reality a direct attack upon the manager plan. It does not seem, however, to have the support of the people. A recent special election was held on a bond issue to rehabilitate the city water works plant. The result of the election was almost a 4 to 1 vote in favor of the bonds, which is significant when it is remembered that the election became in fact a test vote on the popularity of manager government. This was really the issue, those favoring the manager form voting for the bonds and those opposed to the manager voting against the bonds. The interest was very great and the votes cast at the election exceeded by 2,000 the votes cast at the spring election of 1922.

Although the bill has passed the lower house of the legislature it is not expected to pass the senate.

✠

Governor Smith's Consolidation Program for New York.—It seems that Al Smith is to get a part of his administrative reorganization program through, but only a part. He has a majority of one in the state senate, but the opposite party controls the assembly. Consequently the governor finds himself seriously checked in both houses (the senate majority of one cannot be termed safe).

To date, the Republican assembly leaders have been prevailed upon to accept what is in the main the governor's program for reorganizing the administrative departments and agencies. This program is in two parts. The first is a series of measures designed to secure all that is possible by statutory changes. By this means about one hundred independent agencies will be brought into some form of co-ordination with the major departments. But the really fundamental changes will be accomplished by a constitutional amendment which will consolidate all administration (except perhaps the department of farms and markets, and the department of education) into twenty major departments under heads named by the governor. This is practically the same amendment which was put through during Governor Smith's first term, but which failed on second passage under Governor Miller. Governor Smith early came to believe in simplified state government and he has consistently urged it at every opportunity.

Two other important executive measures will probably meet defeat, unless the governor is successful in the direct appeal to the people which he is now making in a series of addresses throughout the state. They are the four-year term for the governor and the executive budget. Party politics is all that holds them up. The arguments of the Republican legislators against the executive budget are silly in view of the party's relation to the federal budget system and the credit they claim therefor.

✠

San Diego County to Vote on Home Rule Charter.—The Board of Freeholders, elected in

January to draft a home rule charter for San Diego county, California, have reported a document which, if adopted, will greatly improve the administration of the county. The charter really provides for a county manager although he is given the title of comptroller. The comptroller is to be elected by the board of supervisors of nine members elected by districts. He is to be ex-officio road commissioner, to have complete control of all road work, and to supervise and care for all public buildings. He shall act as a purchasing agent and shall appoint the subordinates in his department. It will be recalled that a county-manager charter was defeated by the voters of San Diego county in 1917, but the passage of the present "comptroller form" seems assured.

We are indebted to Charles Hoopes, secretary of the Board of Freeholders of San Diego county for the following explanation of the situation:

"San Diego county is governed by the old system under which supervisors are elected from road districts. They form the legislative, administrative and executive committee which handles all county money, levies taxes, etc. The districts have not been changed in many years, but the county and especially the cities have grown enormously. The result is that the representation is unfairly distributed. The control of our county government has passed to a 'machine' which requires only the votes from a few petty districts to perpetuate itself. The government has been taken over by those with selfish interests and the majority of the people have no voice in their government.

"This has caused a high tax rate and a resulting depreciation of land values. This government has been, and is, wasteful and extravagant, especially along the lines of dirt road upkeep and temporary construction generally. The increase in traffic, due to the automobile, has changed our road problems, and technical skill rather than political pull is required if we are to obtain efficient management.

"The basic principles involved are: re-districting and the maintenance of balanced districts, a county manager or 'controller,' a purchasing agent, and the installation of business methods generally in our county government.

"Our city and the neighboring city of Coronado have city managers and find them satisfactory, but the county machine is fighting with its back to the wall and the battle will probably be a hard one."

Ohio Governor Removes Mayor.—On March 8 of this year the governor of Ohio, A. V. Donahey, removed from office Mayor Herbert H. Vogt of the city of Massillon. The governor exercised this power under Section 4268 of the General Code of Ohio, which provides that the governor may remove a mayor for "misconduct in office, bribery, any gross neglect of duty, gross immorality, or habitual drunkenness . . . , upon notice and after affording such mayor a full and fair opportunity to be heard in his defense." The governor's executive order states, according to a newspaper account, that Mayor Vogt "was guilty of non-feasance in office and gross and wilful neglect of duty in office, in that he did not in good faith try to enforce the laws" and that he was "guilty of misconduct in office," in that when a police chief resigned under pressure of public opinion he was reappointed as a patrolman and subsequently when the new chief was also compelled to resign under pressure of public opinion the mayor reappointed as chief the former chief and gave chief No. 2 a subordinate job in the force. The governor concludes that these appointments, resignations and reappointments show "the existence of a ring of officers notably lax in the enforcement of the laws."

Mayor Vogt claims that the evidence at the hearing was almost wholly given by unreliable witnesses such as "ex-convicts, a man serving a sentence in workhouse and two former police officers under suspended sentence to the penitentiary." He also set forth that he was opposed by certain propertied groups which disapproved of his efforts to annex certain suburbs which were escaping what he considered fair taxation, and that the movement for removal was only a pretext to get him out of office. Mayor Vogt, a Socialist, was serving his second term, when he was removed.

This power of the governor to remove mayors has rarely been invoked in Ohio, but under certain conditions might be the source of a very great question of public policy. In this case the chief complaint against Mayor Vogt was his failure to enforce prohibition laws and it may be presumed that private agencies for pushing the enforcement of these laws were, to say the least, favorable to his removal. The possibilities in this law for state-wide groups and organizations are quite apparent.

RAYMOND MOLEY.

Ramsey County (St. Paul) Gives Up Pay-As-You-Go Policy.—Ramsey county, Minnesota, is comprised of the city of St. Paul, city of White Bear Lake, two villages and four townships. St. Paul has 97 per cent of the population, 34 per cent of the area of Ramsey county. Furthermore, 97 cents out of every dollar spent by the county comes from the taxpayers of St. Paul.

Aside from the physical relation between the two there is a close relation between the governments of St. Paul and Ramsey county. Each has its separate organization, but there are several points of contact between the two. Four of the county commissioners are elected from the city and the remaining two from the outlying districts. The mayor of the city acts as chairman of the board of county commissioners. All of the assessments made in the county are made by the county assessor who is appointed by the mayor of St. Paul, the vice-chairman of the city council and the county auditor. The county treasurer collects all of the taxes including special assessments.

The county budget for 1923 has been decreased to the extent of $781,646.38 under the 1922 appropriation. This was made possible by adopting the plan of paying for permanent road improvements from the proceeds of bond issues.

Ramsey county has been on a pay-as-you-go policy as far as roads and pavements were concerned. Each year a program of road improvements was presented and an amount appropriated to carry out this program as well as to provide maintenance on present improvements. However, a certain amount of the paving projects were financed by bonds issued by the county which were taken over by the state. These projects were on main trunk highways designated by the state and to be paid for by the state. The largest amount of paving was done on a pay-as-you-go policy which is to be discontinued in 1923. The reason for this is to permit a larger program of road construction to be put through at once and to distribute the burden of payment over a greater period of years.

It had been felt for some time that the county paving program was not progressing as rapidly as it should. On a pay-as-you-go program the amount of money that could be expended out of taxes in any one year was limited. A program of county road improvements was therefore planned this year by a county planning board working with the board of county commissioners. The program arrived at involved an expenditure of seven and one-half million dollars. All of this paving is necessary at the present time. It was therefore decided to discontinue the pay-as-you-go program and ask the state legislature to authorize the county to issue bonds in that amount to take care of the contemplated program. The proposed act is to be presented to the legislature now in session.

KENNETH GODWIN,
St. Paul Bureau of Municipal Research.

*

Zoning Ordinance Sustained Although Certain Regulations Unreasonable.—*State ex rel Kosloy* v. *Quigley* was an application before the supreme court of New Jersey for an alternate or peremptory writ of mandamus to command the inspector of buildings in Paterson to approve plans for the alteration of a dwelling into a combined store and dwelling in a residence zone. When altered it was proposed to use the dwelling concerned as a butcher shop. The decision in this case is especially remarkable for the fine discrimination the courts are beginning to display in passing upon the legality of zoning.

Prior to adoption of zoning Paterson had been so afflicted by out-of-place building that practically every block in the city was spotted by some store or factory. The result was that to obtain any zoning at all, a considerable number of non-conforming buildings had to be created. It so happened that the relator's building was situated in a block in which there were several such non-conforming buildings. Next to it was a candy store. Next to the candy store was a grocery store. Further along in the block were still other stores.

The ordinance was attacked by the relator *in toto* as unconstitutional. In refusing to follow the relator in this respect the court was very careful to distinguish between a proper application of the zoning principle in districts exclusively residential or industrial and in districts of a mixed character which are neither one nor the other. "We are unwilling," said the court, "either to declare the statute under the authority of which the ordinance was passed unconstitutional, or the ordinance void *in toto*. There are many excellent features in zoning ordinances.

"The remedy of mandamus invoked in the present case . . . enables us to determine without passing upon the validity of all the features of the ordinance, whether or not the rights of the relator are invaded by the action taken in

refusing to approve the plans submitted and to issue a building permit. We are of the opinion that the relator is deprived of a use of his property not necessary for the preservation of the public health, safety and general welfare. The relator has established, in the locality in which he has purchased the residential property he desires to alter into a combined store and dwelling, a butcher business. Properties adjacent to the relator's are used as stores. There are in the immediate vicinity candy shops, grocery stores, bakeries, a tailoring establishment, etc. Should the relator be forever restricted to the use of his property for residential purposes when the owners of adjacent properties have the privilege of using their properties as stores? The proximity of the stores would probably lessen the rental value of the relator's property for residential purposes. The property could not, therefore, be used for the purpose for which it would yield the best return. There is no testimony in the record to show that the proposed use of the relator's property is detrimental to public health, safety or general welfare. The prohibition of the intended use of the property is not, in our opinion, a valid exercise of the police power."

The decision suggests that the courts are anxious to go as far as they can in sustaining zoning. Their desire in this respect is, however, not going to prevent them from testing the reasonableness of every zone boundary line when it appears that it cannot be sustained as a valid exercise of the police power.

This is very strongly suggested in this case for the court by implication upheld the constitutionality of the ordinance as a whole while it at the same time held the application of the zoning regulations to a particular piece of property unreasonable. HERBERT S. SWAN.

✠

New York Charter Revision Commission Reports Under Unauspicious Conditions.—New York City has had no comprehensive charter revision since 1901. There have been several unsuccessful attempts and apparently the usual fate awaits the report just published by the New York Charter Revision Commission.

The commission has done a careful piece of work under difficult circumstances. The basic proposal is to give the city a greatly enlarged measure of self-government. The charter proper would begin with a broad grant of home rule powers followed by a detailed grant of specific powers. These powers would be sufficiently comprehensive to transfer a great mass of local legislation from that state capitol to the city hall. The two most peculiar features of New York city government, namely the powerful board of estimate and apportionment and the borough presidents, would be retained.

The borough presidents were established as a compromise with the principle of centralization when the greater city absorbed Brooklyn and other separate communities. They sit on the board of estimate and have important administrative jurisdiction over highways, buildings and sewers. The system is often criticized but is politically popular.

The board of estimate has appropriating and other functions suggestive of a commission form of government but the heads of departments are mostly appointed by the mayor. It has an excellent form of procedure and most New Yorkers agree with the commission that it should be retained. The same can be said as to the large powers of the comptroller and the definite executive responsibility of the mayor. Some New Yorkers see the advantages of the city-manager plan, but the community is not ready for it.

The proposed charter prescribes the election of members of the board of estimate and of the board of aldermen and gives to the two boards some concurrent and some separate powers, residual legislative jurisdiction remaining in the board of aldermen as a single legislative chamber subject to the mayor's power of veto.

With the exception of the bureaus under the borough presidents and a few specified departments under the mayor, such as police, taxation and civil service, the whole administrative structure would be fluid in the sense that bureaus and departments could be set up, abolished or consolidated by local action without amendment of the charter itself. The departmental structure and rules of procedure would ultimately be provided for in a locally adopted administrative code.

The proposed charter, however, contains fairly detailed financial requirements in regard to budget making, appropriations, taxation, local assessments and bond issues. A number of detailed changes are recommended, such as absorption of the duties of the sinking fund commission by the board of estimate, placing of all revenue collecting in one department and setting up of a board of tax review outside the depart-

ment of taxes. The board of estimate and board of aldermen would be given powers which they do not now have over the salary schedules of county employees in the five counties within the city. The board of estimate would have greatly enlarged powers for going into revenue producing undertakings. There would also be new home rule jurisdiction to classify and determine the valuation of private property for the purposes of taxation.

Recognition is given to the principle that public education is a subject for state regulation even though it is still to be paid for chiefly by local taxation. A somewhat greater degree of financial independence for the school system is proposed, stopping short, however, of the exercise of separate taxing powers.

The report reflects the almost universal demand among New Yorkers for more self-government. But it reflects also the current misgivings about the ability of the board of aldermen as now chosen to adequately meet its greater responsibilities. In this connection a notable feature is the strong plea for the principle of proportional representation, which, however, might require an amendment of the New York constitution. RAYMOND V. INGERSOLL.

✦

Wyoming Manager Law Constitutional—Strange Method of Electing Council.—Two years ago the Wyoming legislature passed an act providing for the commission-manager plan of city government. Any municipality which had a population of 1,000 or more might, by popular vote, adopt the plan. The law contained the usual provisions of such statutes in regard to the choice of the manager and the fixing of his salary. A number of the voters of the city of Sheridan, in accordance with the procedure provided for in the law, petitioned the council for a submission of the question of the adoption of the plan to the voters. On advice of the city attorney the council refused to call the election. A suit in mandamus was filed in the district court of Sheridan county to require the council to call the special election. The district court certified the case to the supreme court for decision on certain reserve constitutional questions.

Before the supreme court R. G. Diefenderfer, the city attorney of Sheridan, questioned the validity of the act on the grounds that:

1. It created a new class of municipalities, the state already having more than its constitutional quota.

2. It was not and could not be of uniform operation throughout the state.

3. It permitted, contrary to constitutional prohibition, the choice of a non-resident as city manager.

4. It failed, in spite of constitutional requirement, to fix the salary of the manager. In its decision the court held that the act did not create a new class of municipalities, but left the cities adopting the plan in their respective classes. So far as the law might be adopted by any city of a class it was uniform in operation. Since only municipalities of 1,000 or more of the second class might adopt the plan, the statute was void so far as this whole class was concerned, but valid for the other classes.

The Wyoming constitution requires that all those who hold office in the state must be qualified voters. It was granted that a city manager is an officer. Since, therefore, the act permitted the choice of non-residents as city managers, that part of the law was held void by the court.

The state constitution also provides that salaries of officers must be fixed in the constitution or by statute. The act delegated the fixing of the salary of the city manager to the city council. And so the court held that such provision must be made in the law.

Finally, the court held that the act was valid except for the indicated provisions.

To meet the objections of the court an act was passed by the 1923 legislature under which any city or town may adopt the city-manager plan. According to this law the council may employ as city manager one who is a resident of the state and whose salary conforms to the act. The salary varies with the size of the municipality, from $1,800 in towns with a population of less than 2,000 to $8,000 for cities with a population of more than 25,000.

Sheridan and Caspar were the cities that showed the greatest interest in the commission-manager plan two years ago and these cities will, very likely, take a new interest in the matter of adoption with the new law on the statute books.

An interesting feature of the new city-manager law is that provision is made for the choice at a mass meeting of five electors by the voters in their respective wards. These electors at a common meeting select three councilmen for each ward to act as the city council, seemingly a very cumbersome piece of machinery.

HENRY J. PETERSON.

II. CITY-MANAGER NEWS

By John G. Stutz

Executive Secretary, The City Managers' Association, Lawrence, Kansas.

A New Standard for municipal government is being set by commission-manager government. Citizens in hundreds of cities are comparing the services received per tax dollar spent in their cities with the services per tax dollar spent in commission-manager governed cities. The success of the city managers in giving sufficient public service for a price the citizens can afford to pay is winning for the plan the distinction of being a pace-setter in municipal government.

*

Ninth Yearbook Ready for Distribution.—The Ninth Yearbook of The City Managers' Association is ready for distribution. It contains the proceedings of the annual meeting of The City Managers' Association held in Kansas City, November, 1922; a directory of the city-manager cities, the city managers and their salaries, and other tables showing the growth and the development of the city-manager plan. A special feature of the Ninth Yearbook is a section devoted to city administration in ten representative city-manager cities in the United States and Canada. An article of 2,000 words illustrated by pictures and charts has been written on the city management in each of these ten representative cities. The Yearbook shows 310 cities operating, or pledged to the city-manager plan of government on April 1, 1923.

*

City Manager A. M. Wilson has saved the city at least $5,000 on two bridge jobs recently completed by using city labor. It is estimated that this method saves from 25 to 33⅓ per cent on the contractor's estimate.

*

City Manager P. C. Painter of Greensboro, North Carolina, has effected a number of savings in the cost of government during the past year. The four outstanding developments were: A financial policy, the organization of a health department, the making of a comprehensive topographical map, and the establishment of the city-planning and zoning policy. By issuing short term notes, which enabled the city to hold up an issue of a million and one-half dollars worth of bonds, the city was finally able to get a more reasonable interest rate and thereby save $212,000 for the citizens.

City Manager Fred P. Harris of Escanaba, Michigan, has succeeded in reducing the water and the electric light rates 15 per cent, and the gas rates 25 per cent. These utilities are still yielding a profit of $100,000 per year.

*

A Special Election will be held in Grand Rapids, Michigan, for the consideration of certain amendments to the city charter. The proposed amendments would seriously hamper the administration of the city-manager plan as it now operates.

*

Berkeley, California, will begin operation under the city-manager plan July 25, 1923.

*

Longview, Texas, adopted a charter providing for the commission-manager plan on February 20, 1923. The charter provides that the city manager must be an engineer.

*

The Citizens of Bartlesville, Oklahoma, turned down a city-manager charter on March 12. It is reported that a hot contest between two factions in the city for control of the government overshadowed the issue of the form of government and caused its defeat.

*

South Carolina Cities with populations between 20,000 and 50,000 will be permitted to adopt the city-manager plan of government through authority granted them by the recent legislature.

*

N. A. Kemmish, city manager of Alliance, Nebraska, holds a good record for consistent salary increases. He was employed at $5,000 per year and has received a raise of $500 each year for three years.

*

Seattle, Washington, is making another attempt to secure commission-manager government. Fifteen freeholders are to be elected at a general city election on May 8, with instructions to prepare a new charter for submission to the voters in the spring of 1924.

*

The Following Cities are considering the city-manager plan of government: Wheaton, Illinois;

Venice, California; Nahant, Massachusetts; Cleveland, Tennessee; Wellington, Kansas; Sterling, Colorado; Austin, Texas; Marshall, Texas; Beatrice, Nebraska; Santa Ana, California; Enid, Oklahoma; Spartanburg, South Carolina; Nebraska City, Nebraska, and Wellesley, Massachusetts.

✠

Mrs. Bertha Heidenfelder became the first woman city manager in the history of the city-manager movement when she accepted the position of city manager of Collinsville, Oklahoma, December 1, 1922. Collinsville is a city of 3,801 population. Mrs. Heidenfelder's previous experience includes three years as a deputy in the office of the former city manager. She receives a salary of $1,900 per year.

✠

Mrs. R. E. Barrett became the second woman city manager in the history of the city-manager movement when she accepted the position of city manager of Warrenton, Oregon, on March 27, 1923, at a salary of $3,600 per year.

Roy M. Wilcomb has been appointed city manager of Springfield, Vermont, at a salary of $4,000 a year.

✠

Clyde King has been appointed city manager of El Dorado, Kansas, at a salary of $3,600 the year.

✠

Mr. Paul B. Steintorf has been appointed city manager of Calexico, California, at a salary of $3,600 per year, plus $600 a year allowance for automobile maintenance.

✠

Willard F. Day has been appointed city manager of Staunton, Virginia, at a salary of $4,000 per year. He succeeds S. D. Holsinger, who has a record of twelve years as city manager of Staunton.

✠

Charles Hess has been appointed city manager of McAlester, Oklahoma, at a salary of $3,600 per year.

III. MISCELLANEOUS

The Baltimore City Club has begun what promises to be a successful campaign to sell $250,000 worth of stock in the new city club building. The building will cost $700,000.

✠

The Chicago City Club has emerged victorious in a campaign for 1,000 new members. The American City Bureau assisted in the campaign.

✠

The Detroit Bureau of Governmental Research has again published what has come to be an annual report on the city budget. It is a condensed and popular review of the mayor's budget estimates as submitted to the council. The functional purposes of the various appropriations are explained for the benefit of the average citizen.

✠

Los Angeles Public Defender.—During the year 1922, according to the report of Mayor Cryer, the city police court defender of Los Angeles, represented in the police courts a total of 2,504 persons. In addition to representing persons in court this office gives advice and legal information to those in the city jail who are unable to consult private attorneys.

Frank B. Williams has offered a prize of $250 to students in any department of Harvard University for the best essay on the laws and regulations relating to platting of land in the United States as affecting the desirability of lots for dwelling purposes. The judges are Albert S. Bard, Thomas Adams and Nelson P. Lewis.

✠

New Book on the Merit System.—The government research division of the University of Texas have just published a book of 114 pages from the pen of Mr. B. F. Wright, Jr., entitled, "The Merit System in American Cities," with special reference to Texas, which will be found a ready source of information upon the application of the merit system in state government.

✠

The Philadelphia Bureau of Municipal Research has published a study of the cost of a workingman's standard of living in Philadelphia at March, 1923, prices. The pamphlet is designed as a supplement to the volume earlier published by the Bureau entitled, "Workingmen's Standard of Living in Philadelphia."

✠

Baxter Durham, state auditor of North Carolina, has recommended to Governor Morrison a

reorganization scheme for the administrative departments of the state by which the 66 existing agencies would be combined into 16 major departments.

✻

A State Park Bond Issue.—Measures have been introduced into the New York legislature calling for a bond issue not to exceed $15,000,000 for the acquisition of lands for state park purposes, for permanent improvements and betterments within state parks, and for parkway connections. The bill, if passed, will be submitted to the people at the general election in November.

✻

How Theatre Crowds Congest Times Square.—There has developed in the New York theatre district a very awkward, almost alarming, situation. Mr. Nelson P. Lewis, chief of the physical survey being conducted by The Plan of New York and Its Environs, points out that between 38th and 51st Streets and between 6th and 8th Avenues there are no less than 78 theatres. Their combined seating capacity is 95,294. Forty-four of them, with a seating capacity of 55,911, are within a circle having a radius of 1,000 feet from the center of Broadway and 42nd Street. Assume for a moment that of the 56,000, 35,000 come from the Times Square Station between 8.00 and 8.30. From this station Interborough and Brooklyn Rapid Transit trains run both north and south, while a shuttle train runs to the Grand Central Station and the east side Interborough line. If these 35,000 people were equally distributed between these five routes, it would mean that 7,000 people would have to be accommodated by each. Now if two-thirds of this total arrived between 8.00 and 8.15 and one-third between 8.15 and 8.30, it would mean that 4,700 people would arrive from each of these five directions in the latter quarter of an hour. The performances are over very nearly at the same time and the period during which the crowds wish to reach the subway trains is considerably shorter. Let us assume, however, that they will be obliged to occupy the same half hour in dispersing. A ten-car train, loaded to capacity, holds about 1,300, while with all the standing room occupied to the limit of decency, it will hold 1,000. If, then, such ten-car trains left in each of these five directions every three minutes, it would mean that 940 passengers would try to crowd into these trains without regard to the number already in them. The conditions are even worse than this as the shuttle trains, while they start from the Times Square Station and may be available for the theatre crowd, are generally made up of less than one-half the number of cars assumed for the other trains.

The practice prevailing in London of issuing building permits for structures containing places of public assembly only after reports from the police and fire departments as to the effect upon traffic and fire hazard might have prevented the conditions to which attention is called.

✻

The Function of the Engineer in Government.—"Among all the engineering works that have contributed to the reduction of sickness and death and the accompanying suffering and heart-breaks, probably none equals public water supplies—at least not on the North American continent. Probably sewerage systems come next, but if so then it is the quick removal of human excreta from our houses and yards and streets rather than its final disposal that deserves the credit. Plumbing, except as means for distributing water to points of use and removing it after it has been soiled, seems to have but a minor relation to health. Garbage collection is more a branch of municipal cleansing or housekeeping than of health, except where garbage uncollected attracts flies that have access to privies, or rats that may spread plague. The final disposal of garbage is still less a health matter. The character of paving and of street cleansing, it seems to me, has far more of a bearing upon public health than has garbage collection or disposal. Where mosquitos and malaria or yellow fever prevail, engineering works in the nature of land drainage are generally the best and cheapest means of control.

"House and building design and construction, with particular reference to air, warmth and light, dryness, the saving of labor for housewives, and general convenience play their part in public health. Heretofore, these things have been regarded as the function of the architect, but for years now we have had heating and ventilating engineers, while in various ways the engineer is becoming more and more concerned with the construction of houses and other buildings. From the engineer we may expect a reduction in the cost of housing that can come only from the introduction of labor and material saving through systemization, quantity production and like

engineering methods. With a reduction in the cost of shelter may be expected a relief from the overcrowding and other evils that undermine health and spread disease. This brings us to housing in its broader aspects, of which no more need be said than that it is a part of the new science of city planning, including zoning, which after so many long years of unfortunate and shameful neglect is now beginning to receive some part of the attention which it so richly deserves.

"I believe it is to city planning and its results that we must look for much of the future improvement in public health and particularly for a further reduction in the general death rate in so far as these depend upon engineering work; a reduction traceable not so much to any one readily specified measure as to improvement in many interrelated causes that go to make up community convenience, comfort and mental and physical health."—From a lecture on Engineering and Public Health delivered by Mr. M. N. Baker, before Johns Hopkins University and Boston Society of Civil Engineers.

The American

HOME & CITY BEAUTIFUL EXPOSITION

Million Dollar Pier, Atlantic City

JUNE 16th to SEPT. 8th, 1923

A 12 Week Exhibit of Innovations and Surpassing Beauty to Boost American Industry and Home and City Beautiful Movements.

Featuring City Beautiful Exhibit of materials, equipments, specialties and apparatus for municipal use.

Thousands of city officials and purchasing agents from all over the country will see your exhibit in this Exposition, National in scope.

Exposition folder and full particulars mailed free

AMERICAN HOME & CITY BEAUTIFUL ASSOCIATION ATLANTIC CITY, NEW JERSEY

Loose-Leaf Digest

of

City Manager Charters

This digest of 167 city manager charters was written by Robert T. Crane. It was planned for use by charter commissions, charter revision committees, charter draftsmen, libraries, and civic organizations and individuals studying the city manager plan of government.

Price, $5.00

National Municipal League

261 Broadway, New York

A Forthcoming Supplement to the

National Municipal Review

State Welfare Administration

and

Consolidated Government

By **C. E. McCOMBS, M. D.**

Address

National Municipal Review

261 Broadway New York

MINOR HIGHWAY PRIVILEGES AS A SOURCE OF CITY REVENUE

By the Committee on Sources of Revenue

I. INTRODUCTION

DEFINITION

MINOR highway privileges are defined, by the bureau of the census in the *Financial Statistics of Cities*, as "licenses or easements granted for utilizing, for purposes specified, portions of the highway or space above or below it. . . ." Included in those are the privileges of excavating sidewalk vaults, erecting overhanging signs, or building balconies or other projections.

No one walking down a city street can fail to be impressed with the number of more or less necessary impediments to traffic; piles of material where new buildings are in the course of construction; open manholes where gas mains are being repaired; coal chutes; sidewalk lifts; piles of boxes in the process of being loaded or unloaded; and comparatively harmless street clocks, barber poles and gasoline pumps. For these privileges it is customary, in most cities, to make some more or less nominal charge; but in few instances has any effort been made to develop these charges as a definite source of city revenues. Commissions on new sources of revenues, and other bodies and officials concerned, have not overlooked this source. They have frequently considered, and almost as frequently recommended, new or increased charges for minor highway privileges. But only rarely has any action been taken upon these recommendations,—perhaps because the yield at best would be far from adequate to meet the city's need.

Major highway privileges, *i.e.*, the operating franchises of public utilities, are far more valuable. In 1919[1] these yielded 93 per cent of the revenue obtained from all highway privileges in cities of 30,000 population and over. But the more valuable franchises have been disposed of long since. Moreover, where public utilities are adequately controlled it would seem desirable, since their services are essential to the general welfare, that they should be required to maintain low rates for these rather than that they should be permitted to charge higher rates and then return them in part to the general public in the form of franchise taxes.

With minor highway privileges the situation is somewhat different. Public utilities facilitate traffic, and it is important not to interfere with them but, the uses of the street for which minor highway privileges are granted tend rather to impede traffic, and any unnecessary use should be discouraged. A charge for storing building materials in the streets, for instance, will discourage avoidable delays in removing them. Consequently there is no objection to charging "what the traffic will bear" in most cases.

[1] This and the following data are from the United States census bureau's *Financial Statistics of Cities*. This report was not published by the census bureau for the year 1920, and the 1921 report contains only a part of those cities of 30,000 population and over, and does not differentiate between major and minor highway privileges.

REVENUE FROM MINOR HIGHWAY PRIVILEGES

Cities have not had adequate experience with these sources to indicate the amount of revenue that they can be made to yield. The income derived from them thus far is small. In 1915, when the yield of minor highway privilege dues was largest, only one and one-half million dollars was obtained from them in cities of 30,000 population and over. In 1919 less than one million dollars ($906,857) was derived from these privileges, or less than one-tenth of 1 per cent of revenue receipts; and of this amount more than one-half ($494,191) was obtained in one city, Chicago. But there are any number of legitimate uses of the streets which have a considerable value, and for which some charge can be made. Those privilege dues yielding the largest revenue in 1919 are, in the order of their yield, vaults and tunnels, spur tracks and sidings, venders' stands, street signs and awnings, pipes and conduits, and storage of building material. Occasionally charges are also made for street bridges, storage and sale of merchandise, areaways, erection of poles, gasoline tanks, bay windows, and platforms of one kind or another. The fact that in most cases one-half or more of the revenues from each one of these sources is derived in one city indicates that these are almost untouched sources. Only in New York, Chicago and Baltimore has any considerable development of these charges taken place, and even here there is opportunity for further extension. These cities obtain only one-tenth of 1 per cent, five-tenths of 1 per cent, and three-tenths of 1 per cent respectively, of revenue receipts from minor highway privileges.

YIELD OF MINOR HIGHWAY PRIVILEGE DUES IN CITIES OF 30,000 POPULATION AND OVER IN 1919, SHOWING THOSE CITIES OBTAINING THE LARGEST AMOUNT FROM EACH SOURCE

Source	Total received by all cities	Cities receiving most from each source		
		Name of city	Amount received	Per cent of total
All sources	$906,857	Chicago	$494,151	54.5
Special sources				
Vaults and tunnels	130,096	New York	119,549	92.0
Spur tracks and sidings	118,214	Chicago	86,758	73.4
Venders' stands	117,485	Chicago	52,320	44.5
Street signs and awnings	92,581	New York	45,145	48.8
Pipes and conduits	25,604	Chicago	15,205	59.4
Storage building material	18,790	Philadelphia	5,663	30.2

PRINCIPLES CONTROLLING RATES

There are as yet, no accepted standards for determining the amount and nature of minor highway privilege dues. The lack of experience in making charges for these privileges makes it impossible to determine the rate of the charge which may be made for any specific privilege. But agreement on the factors which should determine the nature of such charges ought to be attained readily. Whether or not, for example, the charge of one hundred dollars made in Baltimore for a bay window projecting into the street is adequate, is difficult to say. But since the value of such a privilege depends largely on its duration it seems clear that an annual license charge, in the nature of a rental for the use of street space, would be fairer than this single

payment; and probably also more lucrative in spite of some additional cost of administration.

In the case of sidewalk vaults, bay windows, porches and other comparatively permanent uses of the streets, in so far as they are permitted at all, an annual charge varying with the space occupied should be imposed. The rates will vary necessarily, as the value of the privilege varies, for different kinds of privileges in different cities, and in different streets in the same city, but they will tend to equal full rental value as nearly as that may be ascertained. For the temporary uses also, such as sidewalk stands and the storage of building materials, the charge, although not recurring, should vary with the length of occupancy as well as space occupied. Other factors to be considered are the extent to which the highway is obstructed and any damage to pavements which may result. Needless obstructions should be forbidden, and where privileges interfere with traffic the charge should be heavy enough to prevent unnecessarily prolonged use. Any injury to pavements should be repaired or else met by the charge.

The two minor highway privileges receiving the most attention as sources of revenue are sidewalk vaults and street advertisements. For this reason the committee presents the situation with regard to each of these in the following two sections of this report.

II. SIDEWALK VAULTS

Sidewalk vaults are one of the most valuable of street privileges, but they are rarely licensed at a rate even approximating their value. A nominal charge for a permit is often as much as any city attempts to make, and not all cities charge even this. Very few cities report any revenue at all from this source, and none report any large amount.

The abutting property owner always has special rights in using the streets, and where the fee of the street is invested in the abutting property owner it is open to question whether the city can control the construction of such vaults, or place special charges on them, as long as they are safe and do not interfere with the proper use of the streets. But if no special charge can be imposed they can still be assessed and taxed with other real estate under the general property tax. This is in fact done to some extent. In New Haven, for example, the value of sidewalk vaults is definitely included in the value of real estate. And in all cases the presence of such vaults adds to the value of the adjoining property and the increased value is probably in some measure reflected in the assessed value of the property. If the city holds fee title to the land, however, it is entitled to something more than a tax on the assessed value of the property, and the full rental value of such space may be charged.

CHICAGO EXPERIENCE

Chicago led the way in imposing special charges on sub-surface area vaults. These charges, when first imposed in February, 1904, equalled 2 per cent on a value obtained by assessing the area at one-tenth of the average assessed value per square foot of the abutting property. This was later raised to 4 per cent, and since the assessed value of property in Chicago is about 25 per cent of actual value this made a rate equal to one mill on

the market value of abutting property,—a very low charge. In those cases where the vault extended more than fifteen feet below the surface one-half of the above rate was charged for every twelve feet, or fraction thereof, in depth. This measure resulted in some eight suits being started against the city to determine the right of the city to make such charges. In the decisions handed down by the supreme court of the state it was held that in many parts of the city the fee to the property rested in the abutting property owners, and that in consequence no rental could be charged by the city. As a result of these decisions, those property owners in the districts in which the fee to the streets was in the city petitioned the city council for repeal of the ordinance, in as much as it could not be universally enforced; and in January 1912, the council passed a new ordinance repealing the rental charge, and imposing instead a flat rate of five dollars for the first 4,000 cubic feet, and one dollar for each additional 1,000 cubic feet or fraction thereof. The yield of the original charges proved to be small, largely because of the uncertain status of the charge. It never attained the estimates made at the time when it was first imposed. The present permit fee yields much less. Only $2,578 was derived from it in 1919.

RATES IN OTHER CITIES

In Baltimore an annual charge is levied on the value of the area of the vault. The rate is 5 per cent of a valuation obtained by assessing the area of the vault at one-half of the assessed value of abutting property. Since property is supposedly assessed at full value in Baltimore this would seem to be a heavy tax, but the actual yield reported is very small.

Omaha, Nebraska, obtained between $16,000 and $17,000 from this source in 1918, the first year that such a charge was made. The rates in this city are fifteen mills for sidewalk space and twenty-five mills for other. This rate is on the assessed value of the area of the vault, such assessed value to equal the average assessed value of abutting property. Taking into consideration the fact that real estate in Nebraska is assessed at only 20 per cent of its value this means a rate of three to five mills on market value. This is a much lower rate than that in Baltimore and less than one-fourth of the usual tax rate on real estate as a whole in Omaha.

Lincoln, Nebraska, has been levying a rental charge for a number of years which varies, as do those in Baltimore and Omaha, with the floor space of the vault and the assessed value of the abutting property. The rate amounts to approximately two mills on actual value,—a rate lower than that in Omaha. The general property tax rate in Lincoln is usually higher than that in Omaha. Owing to the low rate and the small size of the city, the yield is very small.

In New York, Philadelphia, Buffalo and a few other cities, a considerable initial charge is made for the permit, but there are no further payments and the revenue accruing is comparatively small. It was estimated by the commission on new sources of revenue of the City of New York in their report in 1913 that the revenue that New York city could derive from vaults under certain business streets would be over one million dollars. While this estimate covered some of the most valuable districts of the city it was for only a very limited area. The total revenue which New York might obtain would be very much larger. Any exact estimate is impossible since the city

does not have complete records of permits granted.

The extensive use of sidewalk vaults is confined to the larger cities, and only in these do they have any great value. But these cities, at least, could derive a very considerable sum from this source by imposing a reasonable charge on all vaults. In many cases such space is used for basement restaurants, stores and barber shops, and has very great value to the occupants.

DETERMINATION OF VALUES AND RATES

What constitutes a reasonable rate of charge for vaults is not very clear. The value of the vault space varies with the value of the abutting land, and charges should vary accordingly. In consequence the assessed value per square foot of abutting property multiplied by the square feet of floor space of the vault would seem to be the most satisfactory basis. Inside lots of uniform depth should be used as a standard for this since the average value per square foot of abutting property will vary with the depth of the lot without in any way affecting the value of adjoining sidewalk vaults. Square feet are chosen in preference to cubic feet because, while the depth of the vault affects its value, the value depends more directly on floor space than on cubic contents. The factor of depth may be taken into account by increasing the rate with the depth,—perhaps, like the former charges in Chicago, adding one-half of the original rate for every twelve feet (or fraction thereof) of depth after the first fifteen feet.

But the rate that should be charged on this valuation is difficult to determine. If the city holds the fee in the streets it is entitled to full rental value; but it is not easy to ascertain such rental value. The vaults can be used only by abutting property owners, and consequently there can be no competitive bidding for them. The actual value of the use to which such vaults are put might be ascertained, but the occupier may not be using them to the best advantage. Vaults now used for coal bins or for storage purposes might conceivably be used to better advantage for basement shops. Moreover, vaults are usually constructed by the owner of the abutting property, and his investment must be taken into account. The assessed value of the abutting property is an indication of the relative value of vaults in different streets and districts, but it does not determine directly the actual value of any one vault, which, being under the surface only, cannot compare in value with the value of the adjoining land. The rates proposed for New York city by the commission of new sources of revenue and by other investigators, and the rates actually used in those cities experimenting with such charges, vary from one mill to fifty mills on a value equivalent to the estimated actual value of abutting property per square foot. As yet there is no standard. The brief experience of Omaha seems to indicate that a five mill rate on the dollar of value is a conservative charge and will yield an appreciable return. Probably a higher rate could be charged without injustice. It is the suggestion of this committee that the initial rate in any city be not less than five mills. Once this has been put into operation it will be possible to increase it or decrease it to meet conditions on the basis of known facts.

III. OUTDOOR ADVERTISING

Outdoor advertising is the second important undeveloped source of revenues from minor highway privileges. The amount obtained from this source in 1919 in cities of 30,000 population and over was $92,581, or 10.2 per cent of all revenue from minor highway privileges. Forty-nine per cent of this amount came from New York city. Baltimore and Chicago are the only other cities reporting more than $5,000 from this source and only eighteen other cities report any revenue at all.

BASIS OF LEVY

All signs projecting into the street, or in any way occupying a portion of the public highway, are subject to municipal regulation and special charges. Billboards or electric signs on private property, if set back from the street, and if fire-proof and otherwise safe, and also not injurious to public morals, are not so clearly subject to further regulation. Some cities, notably Chicago, have carried control further than this, but it has not yet been established beyond dispute that the projection of the sight of an advertisement into the public highway constitutes a special highway privilege, as does the actual physical projection of the advertisement; and consequently such advertisements are probably not subject, for the present, to highway privilege dues. But if billboards on private property cannot be charged for special highway privileges they can be reached by taxes. Where taxes must be uniform on all property they can be taxed as other property. Where special taxes on property are permitted they can be subjected to heavier taxes than other property. Or they may be reached by business taxes,—as in practice they are reached when taxed at all. Such advertising is usually profitable, and not always desirable, and may therefore be made subject to rather heavy taxation.

Those advertisements actually occupying the public highway can be reached by special privilege charges. Such charges may be heavy, both because of the profitableness of advertising and because there is no good reason for encouraging it. Some cities have already restricted it materially; and many cities would probably prefer to place very definite restrictions upon it, or even to prohibit it entirely. But in so far as advertising is tolerated at all it may become a source of considerable revenue.

The ways of reaching advertising are various, as already indicated. The charge may be placed on the advertising company or agent, or on the bill poster; or it may be put on the advertisements themselves. The charges on the companies are business or occupation taxes,—flat or graded in proportion to gross earnings, or bills posted or some other rough measure of business transacted. Those on the advertisements may be ad valorem,—included under the general property taxes,—flat, or graded according to kind of advertisement, or area; or they may be charges for special highway privileges, perhaps a nominal charge for a permit or a small inspection fee,—perhaps a charge graded by area, kind, gross receipts, or the cost of erection, to approximate the true value of the privilege. All of these are considered here because of their close relationship to minor highway privilege dues on advertising.

ADVERTISING AGENTS LICENSE

The business license is the usual way of reaching advertising at pres-

ent. This generally takes the form of a flat rate tax on bill posters, sign painters or advertising agents. Sometimes the charge is only $10, or perhaps $25; but it frequently rises to $100 or $200, and occasionally to $300 or $400. Such rates as these are obviously discriminatory and repressive in intention. The result of high flat rates is, however (judging from the number of companies licensed in the cities imposing them), not so much to check the business as to encourage the concentration of bill posting in the hands of one or two companies. If repression is desired the tax must be graded in proportion to business. This is sometimes done. Other license taxes are on the signs or billboards themselves, and these, particularly when proportioned to area, are far more equitable and may be made either more profitable or more repressive than the flat rate taxes, as preferred.

Of those cities reporting flat rate taxes on advertising, fifty-two tax advertising agents and agencies at rates varying from $5 to $500; ninety-two tax bill posters at rates varying from $1 to $400; twenty-four tax distributors of hand bills and pamphlets from $2 to $550; sixteen tax car advertisements from $30 to $300; two tax billboards from $3 to $10; and two tax electric signs from $1 to $10.[2] This is the more usual form of tax. Some taxes, however, are graded according to gross receipts and some vary with the area of the advertisement. Two cities tax bill posters in proportion to gross receipts; four tax advertising agencies in this way; and one taxes street car advertisements on this base. Business license taxes on advertisements graded according to area occur occasionally and are increasing. But there seems to be no tendency to standardize them. Of thirteen such taxes nine are based on square feet or yards, with rates varying from one-fourth of a cent per square foot to ten cents per square foot. One, based on square feet, has a varying rate according to the location of the advertisement. One is at the rate of fifty cents a running foot, and two are graded roughly into a few classes according to area.

[2] This and the following data are obtained from the report of the census bureau on *Specified Sources of Municipal Revenue*, 1917, with additions and revisions from a questionnaire sent out to cities with more than 30,000 population in 1919. A number of changes have doubtless been made since—but such more recent data—indicates that this list is still representative.

BILLBOARDS

Billboards on private property can probably be reached best by a business license tax proportioned to area. The size of the board is not, however, a sufficient indication of its ability to pay taxes, for a billboard on Broadway or Forty-Second Street in New York city is immensely more valuable than one of the same size in a small village. "Model" billboard taxes, therefore, usually proportion the rate to the size of the city as well as to area. This is the method prevailing in France. Even this is not sufficient. A billboard on Broadway or Forty-Second Street is more valuable than in a more remote part of the city; and it is obvious that a billboard in some parts of New York city might be less valuable than one on the main street of a much smaller city. And even the district does not determine entirely. Two billboards in the same block may have different values because one has a greater "area of projection" than the other. This area of projection does not depend entirely on the size of the board. A billboard at the head of a street, or in a curve, may be seen

for blocks, and in consequence this site is many times more valuable than an adjoining one with a different facing. The simple way of accounting for all of these factors—size, district, and area of projection—is to tax the board on its rental value (or the capitalized value of its rental if taxed as real estate). This may not always be easily ascertained, but it can hardly be more difficult to determine than the assessment of other real estate. Electric signs not projecting into the highway should be taxed in the same way.

PROJECTING SIGNS

Those signs, electric and other, actually occupying any portion of the public highway can be charged an even higher rate for this special privilege; for in this case the full rental value, with the proper discount for cost of construction and maintenance (or, in other words, the rental value of the location occupied), should go to the city rather than to any private property owner. Such rental value is more difficult to determine than in the first case, but it can probably be ascertained. It is doubtful whether the four factors of size, district, kind of sign, and area of projection, which determine the value of the sign, can be accounted for in any simpler way. A further factor to be considered is the extent to which a sign may impede traffic, but any sign which seriously interferes should be prohibited entirely.

CAR ADVERTISING

Advertising in public conveyances, when taxed at all, is ordinarily taxed at a flat rate. Such advertising is usually very profitable, and not particularly objectionable. It is occasionally taxed on gross receipts, as in San Jose, California, where it falls under the business tax on gross receipts. A net receipts tax is preferable, and such a tax can readily be imposed where the city has the power to tax business thus. Such advertising is actually taxed in this way in Chicago, together with the franchise tax on street railways.

IV. ADMINISTRATION

The committee wishes to call attention to the fact that the charges for minor highway privileges which it has suggested cannot be made fair or productive unless adequate machinery for administration is created. The methods of administration now being followed in New York city, Chicago, and Baltimore are worthy of note.

In New York city minor highway privilege dues are collected through the following offices: the five borough presidents, the department of licenses, the department of docks, the department of water supply, gas and electricity, the city clerk and the bureau of buildings.

In Chicago, the majority of the charges are made by the bureau of compensation, though some are administered by the bureau of streets, the department of buildings and the city clerk.

In Baltimore, the administration has been centered almost entirely in the bureau of minor privileges. While this practice commends itself to the committee, we are not certain that it is the best practice for large cities. Centralization undoubtedly serves to increase the efficiency of the administration. There are some privileges, however, which require the approval of other municipal departments, such,

for example, as the laying of conduits in streets, and the erection of gasoline curb pumps. In New York, illuminated signs outside of the building line can be erected only upon the approval of the bureau of buildings and of the department of water supply, gas and electricity. The levy is then made at the rate of ten cents per square foot by the city clerk.

It is clearly impossible to set up a bureau of minor highway privileges in a city government with complete control over matters involving streets, buildings, traffic and fire and police protection, because these functions are entrusted to other city departments. It is, therefore, probable that certain of the minor privileges dues should rightfully be administered directly through the regular departments rather than through a central office.

In setting up the administrative machinery it is necessary to distinguish between permits and between rents. On the basis of suggestions offered in this report, an individual desiring to construct a sub-surface vault within street lines, for example, would be required, first, to secure a permit to construct such a vault, and second, to pay annually a rental charge for the privilege of maintaining the vault. Permits involving minor highway privileges should be issued only on the approval of the regular city department or departments involved. The levy and collection of annual rents, however, should be entrusted to a special bureau or department of the city government.

As a compromise measure, the bureau of minor highway privileges might accept applications for all permits and act as a clearing house for securing the approval of the various departments involved. This function would be assumed in addition to its primary function of administering the annual charges such as those to be levied on outdoor advertising and on vaults. The advisability of such a plan depends primarily on the physical arrangement of the offices of various departments involved and upon the degree of centralized control which exists over municipal administration. This varies from city to city.

The suggestions of the committee with regard to administration may be summarized as follows:

1. The issuance of permits involving minor highway privileges should rest primarily with the regular municipal departments involved.

2. The administration of minor highway privilege charges other than permits should be entrusted to a single office or bureau except where this centralization would overlap the work of other established departments. This bureau might be made also the central clearing house for the issuance of permits involving minor highway privileges.

3. All collections should be made through or under the control of the collecting office of the city.

Beyond these general suggestions, the committee believes it impossible to draw up any definite set of recommendations with regard to administration. Conditions differ widely in different cities.

V. CONCLUSION

It is the conclusion of the committee that minor highway privileges are at the present time a neglected source of municipal revenue in spite of the fact that they represent the use of public property by private individuals for personal profit. So little has been done to tax these minor highway privi-

leges that it is impossible to estimate how much revenue they might be made to yield. While there is no possibility of making them a major source of income, it is clear that in the larger cities, at least, these privileges are of immense value and can and should be made to return a very considerable revenue to the public treasury. Since there is no danger that heavy charges will interfere with any but unimportant and, in most cases, undesirable uses of the public highways, there is every reason for developing minor highway privilege charges extensively. We conclude, therefore:

1. There is no reason why cities should not charge full value when granting privileges for such minor uses of the streets as are necessary, or not undesirable. In view of the difficulty in most cities of obtaining adequate revenues, it seems important that this source of revenue should be developed. Special consideration should be given to charges for sidewalk vaults and street advertising since these are the most valuable minor privileges.

2. For relatively permanent uses of the street the charge should be an annual one, in most cases varying with the space occupied, and in all cases equalling full rental value as nearly as this can be ascertained. The factors determining this value have been considered above.

3. For temporary uses one payment should usually be adequate, but this payment should vary with the length of time for which the privilege is granted. As in the case of the more permanent uses, the charge should equal full rental value.

4. In all cases privileges should be granted for a terminable period.

5. The administration of these charges must be placed upon an efficient and effective basis. This will require the centralization of their administration as far as is practicable and the employment of men who have expert knowledge.